#### FRIDAY, 29TH APRIL, 2016

The Parliament resumed at 10.35 a.m. pursuant to adjournment.

HON. SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer.

#### **PRESENT**

All Honourable Members were present, except the Honourable S.D. Karavaki; the Honourable N. Naiwakula and the Honourable Ratu N.T. Lalabalavu.

#### **MINUTES**

HON. LEADER OF THE GOVERNMENT IN PARLIAMENT.- Madam Speaker, I beg to move:

That the Minutes of the sitting of Parliament held on Thursday, 28th April, 2016, as previously circulated, be taken as read and be confirmed.

HON. A. SUDHAKAR.- Madam Speaker, I second the motion.

Question put.

Motion agreed to.

#### COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE SPEAKER

### Acknowledgment of Hon. Members and Visitors in the Gallery

HON. SPEAKER.- I welcome all Honourable Members to this sitting of Parliament. A warm welcome to the final group of politics students from the University of the South Pacific and other members of the public joining us in the gallery, and those watching the proceedings on television, internet and listening to the radio. Thank you for taking interest in your Parliament.

#### Live Broadcast

I beg your indulgence but this sitting is not yet live because of the Coca Cola Games. They have usurped the TV.

# Delay of Parliament Sitting

Honourable Members, as you know, today is Opposition day and proceedings was supposed to commence at 9.30 a.m. and conclude no later than 12.30 p.m. Due to the unforeseen circumstances that arose this morning, the proceedings had been delayed and, therefore, will be extended.

### Meeting of Women MPs

Women MPs are reminded of their lunch meeting in the Small Committee Room and all other Members will be served lunch in the Big Committee Room.

#### Second Speaker's Debate

I take this opportunity to thank Honourable Members for their contributions in this sitting and we have certainly enjoyed some robust debates. I would also like to advise Honourable Members and the public that the Second Speaker's Debate on the SDGs and key development issues will be held on Monday 9th May in Suva.

Our first Speaker's Debate on the topic of Climate Change was a great success and was attended by over 300 members of the public. This second debate will be on the topic of Violence against Women and Girls in Fiji. I very much hope that even more people will be able to attend this important national event.

# Meeting of the Standing Orders Committee

Honourable Members of the Standing Orders Committee are hereby informed that the Secretariat will send you a notification of the next meeting in order to discuss the proposed amendments to Standing Order 37.

# Motion by Hon. Prem Singh

Finally, please note that the Honourable Prem Singh's motion on item 7 on yesterday's Order Paper was pending at adjournment yesterday. I will, therefore, allow Honourable Prem Singh to move his motion today, just before end of the week's statement.

#### **QUESTIONS**

#### **Oral Questions**

Plans for Possible Change of Operations – MFO, Sinai (Question No. 62/2016)

HON. S.B. VUNIVALU asked the Government, upon notice:

Can the Honourable Minister for Defence, National Security and Immigration explain to this House the plans in place for possible change to the operations in the Multinational Force and Observers (MFO) involving our personnel, given the heightened security level in Sinai?

HON. CAPT. T.L. NATUVA (Minister for Defence, National Security and Immigration).- Madam Speaker, the Honourable Prime Minister and Members of Parliament: I wish to thank the Honourable Member for the question.

At the outset, I wish to applaud, congratulate and acknowledge the RFMF in a major achievement, whereby there will be, in the first time in history, a Fijian of Indian descent, Lt. Col. Avinesh Kumar, who will be the Commanding Officer of the Second Infantry Battalion, Fiji Infantry Regiment (2FIR) with the Multinational Force and Observers (MFO) in Sinai. We wish Lt. Col. Kumar, the MFO and the RFMF all the best in this accomplishment, pegging another milestone achievement in Fiji's reputable footprint in the MFO and the peacekeeping operations.

Madam Speaker, the situation in Sinai is currently unstable, as there have been frequent clashes between the Egyptian Armed Forces (EAF) and the various extremist factions like the Wala'it Sinai and

other affiliates of ISIS. This development has obviously altered various measures of the MFO operations. The MFO's main mission is to observe, verify and report. This Mission still remains, however, the MFO has new tasks in monitoring the close exposure of these clashes to the MFO infrastructure, installations and personnel, and the vulnerabilities.

Madam Speaker, the MFO's operational mandate, coinciding with the situation level now demands the restricted movement within the Northern Area of operations. The Fiji contingent continues with their tasking of providing force protection and escorts to the Civilian Observer Unit (COU). MFO now utilises advanced military equipment to restrict physical movement by utilising satellite imagery in true time; UAVs or Drones for surveillance and patrols and utilising the remote field sites in an unmanned capacity.

The MFO's reconfiguration plan, Madam Speaker, has already commenced with Phase One, where various field sites and checkpoints with the Northern Area of Operation that were occupied by the Fiji personnel have been closed and the personnel relocated to the main base camp in the North, El Gorah.

Currently, the MFO is in its second and third phases whereby the closed remote field sites and checkpoints are being converted to unmanned camera and communication sites. These phases also experience the commencing in downsizing of the MFO in the gradual repatriation of the Columbian contingent (COLBATT). A fraction of the COLBATT is expected to remain but based in the remote sites in the South.

Phase four will see the continuous closing of non-mission essential remote sites to right size the force and reduce risk. Also the downsizing of COLBATT continues and this phase sees the commencement of the downsizing of the US contingent (USBATT) through repatriation, and the remaining relocated to the MFO South Camp in Sham-El-Sheik, about 700-800 kilometres from the North Camp.

The last phase and end state will see the FIJI BATT dominating MFO's physical presence in the Northern Area of Operation and manning four remote sites from the original seven. The minimal presence of the other contingents in the North Camp will be in support capacity. The rest of the MFO relocates to the South MFO Camp of the Sinai. FIJIBATT will then be heavily responsible for the outer and inner cordon security, as well as the operations of the North Camp. The downsized COLBATT and USBATT will man one and three remote sites respectively in the Southern zone.

Madam Speaker, during the recent visit of the Director-General MFO, Ambassador David Satterfield and the Force Commander on 15<sup>th</sup> February of this year to Fiji, they both assured the full support of the MFO to assist FIJI BATT in their various tasking on this new deployment and the reconfiguration operations.

The MFO hierarchy has also assured that there is a sound exit strategy in place with contingencies to counter various scenarios should the strategy be required. The MFO have the aerial capability through the fleet of Blackhawk helicopters to provide air support to our Fiji manned remote sites and further in terms of mobility, the MFO will provide the US M2 Bradley Infantry Fighting Vehicles (IFV) to support the reinforcing or withdrawing contingencies.

Ambassador Satterfield has stressed that in the likelihood the Camp David Accord and a mandate is altered that all governments of serving contingents will be alerted immediately. Both the Director-General and the Force Commander have voiced their praise at the RFMF personnel for past and current exemplary service with the MFO.

Madam Speaker, the Fiji contingent will be going through the scheduled final rotations in the next few weeks that will conclude in early to mid-May, 2016. Government and the RFMF continue to closely

monitor the situation with the assistance and consistent contact with the MFO Headquarters, and the safety and welfare of our service personnel deployed remains paramount.

I thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- A supplementary question, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Supplementary question.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- There is obviously a shift in the US Defence and Operational concept in deploying in the Sinai desert. They are thinning out, so their operational capabilities are reduced. There is an identified threat of increased ISIS activities in Egypt. The COLBATT is now removed or almost removed to a little section based on the remote area as you have stated, and now you increase your capability only for observations and reporting. When it comes to actually stop an offensive you cannot, therefore, the issue at the border is more or less not very well defended.

(Chorus of interjections)

So, I am trying to get from the Hon. Minister, what is their defence policy?

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Hon. Minister for Defence. If you are unable to answer any question, please let me know.

HON. CAPT. T.L. NATUVA .- Madam Speaker, I was asked the question about the RFMF operations. However, the Honourable Member is asking the question regarding the whole concept of operations which is a new question.

HON. SPEAKER.- There being no other supplementary question, I will now give the floor to the Honourable Ashneel Sudhakar.

# Role of the Mediation Service (Question No. 63/2016)

HON. A. SUDHAKAR.- Madam Speaker, before I ask my question, the Coca Cola Games are going on and we have some prominent schools named yesterday - RKS, Marist, QVS and I was checking the medal tally this morning and my school, Xavier College of Ba, is also there. So, congratulations to Xavier College, and hope they are doing well.

Madam Speaker, I rise to ask my question, as follows:

Can the Honourable Minister for Employment, Productivity and Industrial Relations explain the primary role of the Mediation Service, and how has the provision of the Employment Relations Promulgation 2007 contributed towards the amicable and peaceful resolution of disputes?

HON. CDR. S.T. KOROILAVESAU (Minister for Employment, Productivity and Industrial Relations).- Madam Speaker, prior to 2007, trade disputes were only accepted and resolved through

reconciliation and the Arbitration Tribunal as outlined under the formal Trade Disputes Act Cap. 97. This service was an exclusive domain for workers whose members were registered under the Unit which comprised approximately 30 percent of all paid workers. However, there was no recourse available for the remaining 70 percent of the most valuable workers in our society who had to resort to expensive legal redress through courts which they could ill-afford.

Madam Speaker, the enactment of the Employment Relations Promulgations 2007 established the Mediation Services as an alternative litigation in resolving workplace conflicts, and that is now within the reach of ordinary workers and small and medium sized employers. Madam Speaker, this mechanism under the ERP 2007 has been swiftly resolving about 1,000 employment conflicts annually within the timeframe of 30 days. Only an average of 9 percent of the cases have exceeded beyond this timeline which is entirely based upon the request of all parties. The Mediation Service is provided absolutely free of cost to the parties, unlike other Mediation Services within the Asia-Pacific Region that is user-pay.

Madam Speaker, in discharge of its functions, the Mediation Services has a success rate of labour conflict resolution at around 82 percent. This is higher than 75 percent of international benchmark set against the Singapore Mediation Centre, which is rated as one of the best in the Asia-Pacific Region. On an annual basis, the Mediation Services pays about \$1 million to workers every year.

Madam Speaker, the high success rate of grievance resolution has enabled a stable employment relationship to those who utilise the Mediation Services as a means of alternative dispute resolution.

Thank you Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Supplementary question, Honourable Leawere.

HON. M.R. LEAWERE.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Hon. Minister for his response. I would like to pose another question to the Honourable Minister and the question is, are there any plans to establish more tribunals, given the fact that there are pending cases since 2009 yet to be resolved?

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Hon. Minister.

HON. CDR. S.T. KOROILAVESAU.- Madam Speaker, can I request the Honourable Member to repeat his question, please?

HON. SPEAKER.- Please repeat your question, Honourable Leawere.

HON. M.R. LEAWERE.- Madam Speaker, given the fact that there are still some disputes unresolved since 2009, are there any plans by the Ministry to establish more tribunals because of the backlog in cases?

HON. SPEAKER.- Hon. Minister.

HON. CDR. S.T. KOROILAVESAU.- Madam Speaker, we will put in a new budget submission to increase the judges that preside over these tribunals by another two, who will basically be resolving cases in the Western and Northern Divisions, reducing the workload of the two that exist now.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Hon. Prem Singh.

HON. P. SINGH.- Madam Speaker, ERP provides a mediation and adjudication of employment grievances and disputes. It is supposed to be a speedy process, however, Madam, we have noted some success in there.

We were earlier told in the House that some 600 cases are pending. Can the Honourable Minister inform this House on the progress of matters in the Tribunal for adjudication, why are the workers still waiting for judgments from cases that were completed five years ago, and when will the Minister appoint additional members to the Tribunal?

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Hon. Minister.

HON. CDR. S.T. KOROILAVESAU.- Madam Speaker, I had responded to the substantive question and highlighted that we are trying to get two more to reduce the number of outstanding cases.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. There being no other supplementary questions, I now give the floor to the Honourable Mataiasi Niumataiwalu.

Damages to the Forestry Sector (Question No. 64/2016)

HON. M.A. NIUMATAIWALU.- Madam Speaker, before I ask my question, I would like to thank the Government for allowing the Coca Cola Games to take place today and tomorrow because of the traumatic situations that our children had gone through during the cyclone. So, thank you to the Fiji Government and all the best to all the students and those from various schools listening in this morning.

Madam Speaker, I rise to ask my question as follows:

Can the Honourable Minister for Fisheries and Forests brief this House on the scale of damages to the Forestry Sector, especially in terms of Post-Disaster Needs Assessment?

HON. O. NAIQAMU (Minister for Fisheries and Forests).- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Member for his question. Madam Speaker, the Forestry Department has completed its Post-Disaster Needs Assessment on the losses incurred to the forest sector due to *Tropical Cyclone Winston*.

The assessment is confined to plantation forests of pine, mahogany and teak. The total damage figures for the plantation forest is estimated at \$8.5 million in total. Majority of losses includes part of Fiji Pine plantations in Ra and Ba; the Fiji Mahogany Corporation Limited plantation in Nadarivatu, and the Future Forest Teak plantation in Ra. Other significantly damaged forest plantations includes the community woodlot stands within the *Tropical Cyclone Winston* pathway from Vanua Balavu, Taveuni, Koro, Ovalau, Moturiki, Bua, Ra and Ba.

Madam Speaker, the estimated cost for carrying out recovery and rehabilitation works for the plantation areas is \$3.4 million, while the total cost for reconstruction to damage sawmilling infrastructure is estimated at \$1.2 million.

Madam Speaker, estimating damages to plantation forests is quite straight forward. On the other hand, attaching an economic value to the damages in natural forests is yet to be completed as it is relatively complex and it involves a combination of measurement of permanent sample plots, aerial survey and the inclusion of other environmental parameters apart from timber alone.

I thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Supplementary question, I give the floor to the Honourable Samuela Vunivalu.

HON. S.B. VUNIVALU.- Supplementary question, Madam Speaker. What initiatives will the Government do to the damaged trees in the forestry sector around the country for the benefit of the rural community?

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Minister.

HON. O. NAIQAMU.- Madam Speaker, I would also like to provide information on the assistance my Ministry is currently doing through the Department of Forests in assisting communities to obtain timber for their damaged houses.

From the devastation updates made available to us, Madam Speaker, based on the latest statistics from the National Disaster Management Office, a total of 11,927 homes were completely damaged and a total of 19,669 were partially damaged from the cyclone affected areas. These figures exclude schools and other non-residential houses. After doing our estimates and calculations, a total volume of around 182,000 cubic metres of timber will be needed to repair all those damages.

Currently, Fiji's annual timber consumption for construction timber is around 45,000 cubic metres per year. Madam Speaker, the total amount of timber that will be needed for repairs represents four years of total timber consumption for Fiji. It is to be noted also, Madam Speaker, that substantial areas of forests were destroyed and a significant amount of large sized trees were blown over or uprooted during the cyclone.

My Ministry has, therefore, provided assistance to affected villages to enable them to utilise their fallen trees and turn them into sawn timber in order to build their houses for immediate shelter. This assistance is provided directly to villages for two main reasons, Madam Speaker:

- to make use of the fallen timber resources that are easily accessible to provide for housing materials in areas where building materials are badly needed; and
- 2. to salvage and use timber where it is uneconomical for commercial loggers to carry out logging operations due to locality or small number of trees.

Madam Speaker, as of today, we have provided timber to a total of 19 houses in the following areas - Koro, Moturiki, Nabukadra and Nanoko. The timber for these houses were provided for by using one portable sawmill from the Ministry of Forests, one portable sawmill from Fiji Pine Trust and seven chainsaws using seven certified operators.

A total of six portable sawmills have arrived into the country this week and we will start distributing them affected areas, and an additional six portable sawmills will be arriving in May (next month). With the arrival of these portable sawmills, Madam Speaker, we should be able to produce the timber required for building 30 houses per week starting in May, and increasing to 50 houses per week from June, 2016. This means, Madam Speaker, we should be able to provide structural timber materials for over a thousand houses by the end of December, 2016. In addition, this will provide houses for the following areas whose requests are pending - Dawasamu, upper Wainimala, Ovalau, Vanuabalavu, Vanua Levu and Taveuni.

Madam Speaker, my Ministry is also providing training and capacity building for villages that are reusing these machines to ensure safety, efficiency and productivity of the operation. An additional 29 operators are currently being trained for various activities that will be needed when the operation will increase upon the arrival of the additional portable sawmills.

We are also working with the communities to introduce ways in which to carry out timber treatment. Madam Speaker, we have also ordered a portable timber treatment plant from New Zealand which should arrive in the country and be ready for deployment by June, 2016. All sawn timber that needs treatment will be treated from June onwards.

Madam Speaker, those are some of the assistance that my Ministry has been doing in the areas affected by *Tropical Cyclone Winston*. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Kiniviliame Kiliraki.

HON. RATU K. KILIRAKI.- Madam Speaker, before I ask my question, I just want to highlight the need for tabling an assessment report in this Honourable House. The question is in regards to the damages to vegetation and trees, the environmental impact on land and its consequential effects in terms of erosion.

My question is, what is the immediate plan of the Ministry of Fisheries and Forests to replace this, especially the indigenous forest and vegetation, as well as plantations of pine and mahogany?

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Minister.

HON. O. NAIQAMU.- Madam Speaker, the Ministry has embarked on reforestation and also clearing of all damaged plantations, especially with the pine. Navua contractors have been engaged and are starting the logging of all the plantations that were damaged during the cyclone.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Anare Vadei, you have the floor.

HON. A.T. VADEI.- Madam Speaker, a supplementary question; can the Honourable Minister confirm in this House that hardware stores are not selling the untreated timber after this disaster?

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Minister.

HON. O. NAIQAMU.- Madam Speaker, this question is to be directed to the Honourable Minister for Trade.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor the Honourable Alvick Maharaj.

Initiatives to Support Agro-Based Co-operatives (Question No. 65/2016)

HON. A. A. MAHARAJ asked the Government, upon notice:

With the increase in the number of Agro Based Co-operatives registered, can the Honourable Minister for Industry, Trade and Tourism explain to this House what the Ministry has put in place to support these co-operative entities to reach export readiness level?

HON. F.S. KOYA (Minister for Industry, Trade and Tourism).- Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the Honourable Alvick Maharaj for his question.

Madam Speaker, over the years the Ministry has been working with communities to form cooperatives, especially in the resource-based sector. Co-operatives obviously play a vital role in empowering rural communities and in particular, women and the youth. It also fulfils the Government's vision of positioning the growth of the micro, small and medium enterprises development as backbone of the economy. Over the past five years a total of 35 agro-based co-operatives have been registered and have been successfully operating. These co-operatives are in the following: cassava, *dalo*, sugarcane, fruits and vegetables, cattle farming, prawn farming, fish farming and dairy. In order to ensure that the agro-based co-operatives are able to operate in a sustainable manner, the Ministry is working with the Ministry of Agriculture to provide additional advisory support and extension services to these co-operatives. Furthermore, the Ministry through the Department of Co-operatives has provided targeted training. Additionally, the Micro and Small Business Grant Scheme for the next phase will be amended to include co-operative businesses that qualify in the micro and small category. Further, Madam Speaker, the programme such as the National Export Strategy (NES) also provides avenues for financing.

I am also pleased to report in this august House, Madam Speaker, that there has been an increase in uptake to assist this particular segment of the market and there are about 17 agro-based small and medium enterprises that were assisted under the NES Scheme over the last two years; 9 in 2014 and 12 in 2015. A number of these NES recipients are the primary markets for agricultural commodities which they in turn value add and export, and these include kava, ginger, to name a few. We will continue to support this particular sector in the coming years.

Madam Speaker, under the "Fijian Made and Buy Fijian" initiative, the Ministry together with the Ministry of Agriculture, embarked on promoting the Fijian grown brand. As I has alluded to yesterday in my statement, Madam Speaker, the Ministry and the Ministry of Agriculture took the opportunity to promote the Fijian grown brand in Singapore.

Madam Speaker, the "Fijian Made and Buy Fijian" initiative will soon be expanded also to include a Fijian organic brand. The Ministry will work closely with the key stakeholders, including the Ministry of Agriculture, in finalising the key elements to ensure that the Fijian organic branding strategy is successful. There are a number of agro-based co-operatives that are already into organic farming, such as the Taveuni Organic Farmers Co-op Ltd, and these are the very ones that will benefit from these branding strategies.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. A. SUDHAKAR.- A supplementary question, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER. Thank you. Supplementary question, Honourable Ashneel Sudhakar.

HON. A. SUDHAKAR.- Can the Honourable Minister advise this august House, what are some of the different types of agriculture co-operatives that are active in Fiji and will you be able to provide some examples or names of those co-operatives?

HON. F.S. KOYA.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Member for his question. The agriculture-based co-operatives include *dalo*, cassava, sugarcane, fruits and vegetables, cattle farming, prawn farming, fishing, aquaculture, cocoa farming and dairy, to name a few. As I had alluded to earlier in my response, we have 56 registered agriculture-based co-operatives todate, and as earlier stated, 35 have been in the last five years. These co-operatives have been operating successfully.

Madam Speaker, some of the examples of the co-operatives are:

• The Cane Coast Vegetable Farmers Co-op Limited, the Ketenatukani Co-op, Zion Kibbutzim Farmers Co-op, Namure Farmers Co-op, Sunrise Youth Development Co-op, Nadroga Navosa Women's Bee Keepers Co-op and Wailailai Cane Producers Co-op from the Western Division.

- In the Northern Division, we have the Taveuni Organic Farmers Co-op Limited, Northern Bee Keeping Co-op, Culaga Rice Farmers Co-op, the West Korokade Grazing and Marketing Co-op and the Naviu Fishing Co-op.
- For the Central Division, we have the Naule Co-operative Limited, Koronivia Vegetable Farmers, Tailevu Dairy Farmers, Navua Farmers Co-op and the Fiji Farmers Feeds in the Central Division
- In the Eastern Division, there is Navunivanua Sandalwood Co-op, Gaunavinaka Bee Keeping and Oneata Bukatatanoa Vanua Co-op Limited. Those are some of the examples, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Dr. Brij Lal.

HON. DR. B. LAL.- Madam Speaker, can the Honourable Minister please inform the House why is the co-operative model considered a good form of business for communities, especially in the rural areas?

HON. F.S. KOYA.- Madam Speaker, the co-operatives are naturally a more sustainable form of business, one basically that you can plan for a longer term to avoid the pressures that come from the demand of immediate profits.

Co-operatives really enable the grassroots community, Madam Speaker, to do business and make maximum economic use of the available resources or capacity, where you see a single person in a community who may not be able to do that business but in a co-operative model, the like-minded persons in that particular community can pool their resources together to form a business.

They are relatively easy to form. The membership is open to everyone, the community who is able to provide some form of contribution and liability also, Madam Speaker, is limited to the members and the amount of capital contribution that they make. The surplus is obviously shared amongst the members.

To simply put, co-operatives like other small enterprises are the best form of businesses that enable someone to create a strong and resilient economy, as it basically allows for the development of the grassroots people. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Supplementary question, Honourable Salote Radrodro.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Madam Speaker, can the Honourable Minister explain what is the Ministry doing in conjunction with the Ministry of Women to help groups of women who participate in the Women's Expo be elevated to co-operative readiness level for export of their products and handicrafts overseas?

HON. F.S. KOYA.- Madam Speaker, as I alluded to earlier, the programmes that are followed with respect to export readiness is exactly the same for the women and we are closely in touch with the Ministry of Women in any programmes that she is involved in and the exposure we get involved with her to actually train these people, et cetera. So, it is an ongoing programme that is done in conjunction with the Ministry of Agriculture and also the Ministry of Women. We are constantly engaged with them to make sure that they have the benefit of the programme that we have.

HON. SPEAKER. Thank you. That was the third and final supplementary question. I will now give the floor to Honourable Aseri Radrodro.

# Executive Management - Statutory & Semi-Government Organisations (Question No. 66/2016)

# HON. A. M. RADRODRO asked the Government, upon notice:

Many statutory organisations and other semi-government organisations are being managed by the Executive Chairpersons, organisations such as Fiji Sugar Corporation, Airports Fiji Limited, Fiji Pine Commission, Fiji Hardwood Corporation, Post Fiji Limited, Tourism Fiji and Biosecurity Authority of Fiji. Can the Honourable Attorney-General and Minister of Finance, Public Enterprises, Civil Service and Communications explain why is Government taking so long in putting in place proper executive management in these vital organisations?

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM (Attorney General and Minister of Finance, Public Enterprises, Public Service and Communications).- Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the Honourable Radrodro for this question.

Madam Speaker, for his information, it is not a large number of organisations and in fact, the companies his listed, his actually got it wrong. Fiji Hardwood Corporation Limited (FHCL) is not run by an Executive Chair and Fiji Post Limited is not run by an Executive Chair either. I think Honourable Kiliraki is giving you wrong information.

(Laughter)

Madam Speaker, majority of the statutory authorities or semi-government organisations are managed by CEOs or General Managers and not by Executive Chairs. The Ministry of Public Enterprises, Madam Speaker, monitors about 25 State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs) of which only three – Airports Fiji Ltd (AFL), Biosecurity Authority of Fiji (BAF) and Fiji Pine Ltd has an Executive Chair. FSC and Tourism Fiji which are not under Public Enterprises but under the specific line ministries also have an Executive Chair. As I have said, Post Fiji Limited does not have an Executive Chair, Tikaram is not an Executive Chair, nor does Fiji Hardwood Corporation Limited.

Madam Speaker, the reality is that, having an Executive Chair and I refer you to the *Fiji Times* of this week, your favourite newspaper, where it actually reports and talks about an article by the Executive Chair of Bombardier, one of the largest Canadian plane makers. If you look at various financial magazines, newspapers and various literature on running corporations, executive chairmanship is not necessarily a negative thing. Countries throughout the world, it depends on the strategy, it depends on the decision of the Board as to how they want to manage the company. Sometimes, when you go through a particular phase of major restructure or reforms, having an executive chair is essential, other times, it is not.

In Fiji's case, of course, Madam Speaker, we know that what happened post 5th December 2006, when some of the Members from the other side of the House were actively going around campaigning against the various reforms taken by the Bainimarama Government then, and of course, the FijiFirst Government, there were travel bans put. So, obviously, the pool of people that we had to choose from was limited but then again, we found strength in the very fact because of this limitation put on us, we were able to find strength in it and let me tell you what the strengths are, Madam Speaker.

The Honourable Member, who is also a Member of the Public Accounts Committee really should be concerned about the bottom line of these companies, not about executive chairmanship but how well are the companies doing. Are they transparent or not? Are there governance policies being put in place or not?

Let me start off with AFL, Madam Speaker.

(Hon. Member interjected)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, you've asked the question, let me answer it.

Madam Speaker, as you know, there is a major modernisation programme taking place at the AFL. There is an excess of about \$100 million renovation taking place in AFL.

(Hon. Members interjected)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, this progress has not been affected by the absence of a Chief Executive Officer (CEO), in fact, the Executive Chair is not even getting paid an Executive Chairman's salary. He is not getting paid a CEO's salary, his simply as the Chairman of the Board, but he is called Executive Chair, he does not receive those benefits.

Madam Speaker, AFL has continued to increase its dividend payments to Government in recent years from \$1 million in 2010 to 2011 to \$5 million in 2012 and 2013. A record dividend of \$15 million was paid in August 2015. AFL forecasts a profit of \$16 million in 2016 and \$75 million in 2017. It is completely unprecedented, Madam Speaker, in the history of AFL, even before the segmentation that took place in CAAF and all of that, and the Air Traffic Management was given off, now it has been brought back; never before had they so much profit.

Madam Speaker, the fact is also, as you know, that we are currently talking to a consortium in respect of getting some private sector participation and obviously in this sort of state's progress, it is good to have an Executive Chair because with the change in possible change in management, we will be able to then get some long-term positions in place.

The Fiji Pine Limited is no longer called Fiji Pine Commission, it is now called Fiji Pine Limited and FPL, has made a remarkable turnaround, Madam Speaker, under the guardianship of the Executive Chair and the company continues to thrive.

Madam Speaker, FPL's profit increased significantly from a \$5 million loss position in 2010 to profits of \$21.27 million in 2014. In April 2008, prior to the appointment of the Executive Chair, Fiji Pine Limited had become insolvent. It went under mass redundancy and Government ended up paying the loan from FNPF it had guaranteed. Government had to step in. The lead financier, Westpac imposed a condition for Tropik Wood Industry as subsidiary to take over the management of FPL. By 2010, the Pine Group was collapsing due to its bad financial status and mismanagement. The slump in the world wood chip market after the global financial crisis, partially completed capital projects, et cetera.

HON. OPPOSITION MEMBER.- Point of Order!

HON. SPEAKER.- Point of Order.

HON. A.M. RADRODRO.- Point of Order, Madam Speaker. I think the Honourable Minister is going all around with his explanations. The simple question is, why is Government taking so long in making the appointment to these organisations? It is just a simple question but his going round and round.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. SPEAKER.- Order! When you have a broad-based question, then the answer will be broad-based as well. Honourable Minister, please continue.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, your ruling.

HON. SPEAKER.- When the question is broad-based then the answer will also be broad-based and I therefore, give you the floor to continue.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. I will continue where I left off.

Madam Speaker, the Pine Group made losses year after year, prior to the appointment of an Executive Chairperson. Now the latest audited financials for 2015 show a record operating profit of \$24 million. Unprecedented!

HON. MEMBER.- Why?

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, FPL's financial performance and improved cash flow have also enabled the repayment of loans and borrowings as follows:

1. FPL paid \$600,000 in July last year and a further \$600,000 in January of this year, a total of \$1.2 million in just seven months for the \$12 million loan acquired from the Government in 1990.

(Chorus of interjections)

- 2. Repayment of \$10 million loan to Fiji Development Bank (FDB) that financed the FPS Reform Programme in just 20 months, they paid off that loan.
- 3. Repayment of \$6.7 million loan to Fijian Holdings Limited (FDB) in just 17 months. FHL had lend them \$6.7 million, obviously with interests but they repaid that loan in just 17 months.

(Chorus of interjections)

4. Repayment of an European Investment Loan that had been taken in 1985 in a lump sum of \$2.3 million in May 2013 – a debt outstanding since 1985.

(Honourable Member interjected)

Madam Speaker, the Tropik Wood Industry's factory at Drasa Mill in Lautoka is nearing the end of its \$25 million capital upgrade programme, replacing a 40-year old dying machine. They now have a state-of- the-art top of the line sawmill and are presently commissioning it on time. No other country or company has such a factory setup in the entire South Pacific island region and probably none will have for a very long time. The once dying sawmill that was only recovering 28 percent of timber from logs at commissioning stage is now recovering - 54 percent.

Madam Speaker, in one of the latest meetings that the Commission or the company had, the landowners or the representatives themselves asked the Executive Chairman to continue as Executive Chairman and you can go and see the Minutes. The Minutes will show, Madam Speaker, that the Executive Chairmanship was asked to continue.

HON. SPEAKER.- Point of Order!

HON. PROF. B.C. PRASAD.- Madam Speaker, I rise under Standing Order 45(4). I think the Honourable Minister is providing a lot of factual information. He could give a Ministerial Statement but I think he is taking more than his share of the cake in answering the question, which is very simple, which says, and I remember the Honourable Attorney-General telling me, the answer to a question that I asked earlier with respect to the Executive Chairman where he gave the reason that under the previous regime, because of the sanctions, they could not find people so they had to do with Executive Chairman.

So the question is pretty simple, Madam Speaker. He should explain why this corporation still has an Executive Chairman and when the Government, or if the Government is likely to change, but I think that is a very long explanation, he could give a Ministerial Statement on it.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I will just speak on the point of order that have just been mentioned. As I had mentioned, it is a broad-based question. It is talking about proper Executive Management. Management covers a lot of things and also in vital organisations. So, in fact the answer is in order. Please continue.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. I will continue onto the next organisation.

Madam Speaker, let me now move on to Bio-Security Authority of Fiji (BAF) is another company that the Honourable Member mentioned in his question.

Madam Speaker, it does have an Executive Chair. Since the appointment of the Executive Chair, BAF's revenue has increased significantly from \$5.1 million in 2011 to \$9.5 million in 2014, and \$13.9 million in 2015. During the same period, some of the charges that related to most commonly services by farmers, in fact, also decreased.

Madam Speaker, one of the reasons why profits does not only increase because of the increase in fees but also stringent measures and good governance practices and financial management within an organisation, and anyone who runs a company knows about that.

Madam Speaker, what it also meant and what is very critical for us is that we need to be able to have world class standards at our points of entry, both at the sea port and the airport, and that has significantly improved and this is why trade is now improving. This is why Fiji can become a good transshipment hub. You would have seen, Madam Speaker, in the media a few days ago, BAF had reported Giant African Snail (GAS) and this has been picked up primarily because of the effective management of BAF.

An effective debt management system, a reduction of debtors from monthly \$500,000 to nearly zero.

Recruitment of specialised personnel, Madam Speaker, which BAF did not have and the Honourable Minister for Agriculture will also tell you of Veterinarians, Veterinary Biologists and a Food Microbiologist to strengthen BAF's technical capacity.

Madam Speaker, BAF is also doing the Executive championship and have also now put in place the introduction of the Emergency Response Fund in 2013 of \$1.5 million, to combat any exotic pests and diseases that have a devastating effect on flora and fauna.

Madam Speaker, what we now also have is we have ensured successional planning facility in training BAF officers in India, Hawaii, mainland USA, Australia and New Zealand. There has also been a reorganisation of BAF. It has also included reporting of certain officials within BAF to FICAC because of allegations of corruption.

Madam Speaker, let me go on to the last one, I am cutting short my answer. , The Fiji Sugar Corporation so far under the leadership of the Executive Chair, FSC has made significant improvements which include from an operating loss of \$175 million in 2010 to profits of \$6.2million and \$6.9 million in 2013 and 2014 respectively, the payments to cane farmers of 88.49 cents in metric tonnes in 2014.

The TCTS level, Madam Speaker, as we all know and Honourable Prem Singh will also tell you about this has also significantly improved. Government provided funding of only \$138.3 million over two years, as compared to the complete bailout of a \$174 million over the four years recommended by the *Deloitte Report*.

Madam Speaker, as far as Tourism Fiji is concerned, the Honourable Minister for Tourism will also tell you that an advertisement has also gone out in the papers, and I understand they have a short list of people who should be chosen from among that list. Madam Speaker, the point of highlighting this is when the Honourable Members ask these questions, they need to understand that it is not just simply a question of saying; "Executive Chairmanship, "oh, things are bad". You need to look at the company and how it was being run, and of course, in certain instances you do need the separation of the Chair and the CEO. To answer the question, why it is taking so long? It is not taking so long.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. A supplementary question, Hon. Dulakiverata.

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Minister for his long and irrelevant explanation. Madam Speaker, until and unless the Government ceases to employ acquaintances, relatives, who you know and what not, we will never achieve transparency and true democracy. My question is, can the Honourable Minister explain in this Honourable House what is his personal or professional acquaintances with these people before they were appointed to the job?

(Hon. Ratu I.D. Tikoca interjected)

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Minister.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- I do not need to answer the question.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Samuela Vunivalu.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. S. B. VUNIVALU.- A supplementary question, Madam Speaker. Has the Fiji Pine Commission, Airports Fiji Limited and the Bio-Security Authority of Fiji have been performing under the Executive Chairmanship?

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Minister.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the Honourable Vunivalu for his question. The Honourable Member is from the West and he does know that most of these operations of Fiji Pine, for example, and BAF has a lot of significant part of their operations in the Western Division. Of course, I would like to assure him and I am sure that he knows a lot of it, you can see the positive impact that the Executive Chairmanship, in particular the running of these companies has had in the people

that live around it, they are able to source their living from these operations. We now have had a major replanting exercise, for example, under the Fiji Pine Limited where a lot of landowners are benefitting.

Madam Speaker, the problem with the Opposition is that they always tend to personalise matters. They are always looking for some kind of controversy. They do not even read the reports! They do not even read the reports. They do not even understand finance! That gentleman and the three Musketeers, otherwise known as the three stooges in our view, Madam Speaker, do not understand what they are talking about. They need to read the statistics, they need to read the Annual Reports. They need to understand before they ask a question, what is the implication of the question? Madam Speaker that is the unfortunate thing about them.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Supplementary question, Honourable Viliame Gavoka - welcome back.

HON. V.R.GAVOKA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker.

I guess, Madam Speaker, the concern from this side of the House is that if they are not being paid, they cannot continue to do this. They cannot continue to carry out their roles and human nature is such that without any reward, their performance will taper-off someday. So, the concern is that, we need to replace these people as we cannot expect the Executive Chairman to continue to do it for free, and continue to perform. That is our concern.

Can he quickly rectify this as opposed to relying on people who are unpaid to deliver all these great wonderful results? I think there is a danger there. Any student of Business Management will tell you that you cannot continue to rely on someone you are not paying. That is my concern, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Minister.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, I said the only person who is not being paid for the Executive Chairmanship is the Executive Chair of AFL. He is not being paid the executive salary or the CEO salary. All the other Executive Chairpersons for their respective positions are being paid. However, Madam Speaker, this is something the Opposition does not understand. There are many loyal Fijians who provide their services to us since 2007 because they believed in their country. There are many of them who have contributed, not necessarily without a reward.

Madam Speaker, I have also said in my response that when we are getting the right people for these positions, people will be appointed. In the meantime, let us look at the performance of these companies. In the same way, FHCL did have an Executive Chairman, but they no longer do. Your question is out of time, that is the problem. The CEO was appointed last year in December, and Madam Speaker, one thing they do not realise, we should not appoint people just for the sake of appointing people. Let us get the best people for the right job.

#### HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- Hear, hear!

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- The Honourable Prime Minister has been saying; "Let us appoint people based on merit". If they would have their way, they will appoint some mickey-mouse person as a Chairman. That is what used to happen previously, you had mickey-mouses running various boards, people running their companies as CEOs, just so they could fill the positions. I can tell you, Madam Speaker, nepotism then was rife. People were not appointed without merit, and that is a fact. If they were competent people, all these companies that I have highlighted, would have been making lots of money. How come you have all these people now making money? Because they know how to run the companies, Madam Speaker, and that is unfortunately amiss on them.

HON. RATU I.D.TIKOCA.- Sit down.

(Laughter)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- I am not taking that.

HON. SPEAKER.- Sorry?

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- He said for me to sit down, he is not the Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Please withdraw your statement, Honourable Member.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA. - I withdraw my statement.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Thank you.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. ROKO T.T.S. DRAUNIDALO.- Madam Speaker, Point of Order in terms of fairness, there were other comments from the other side that was quite audible the other day, like "shut up". I will not say who, but let us be fair here, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- As I had made a ruling previously, if someone says a word that is disrespectful and offensive to another Member and if the Member raises a Point of Order, I will address it. If the Point of Order was not raised, then I did not hear it because I am concentrating on the person that has the floor.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.-Madam Speaker, I need your guidance on this. The Honourable Ratu Tikoca just said whilst you were saying that, he said "unbalanced". Through you, Madam Speaker, who were you referring to as "unbalanced"? This needs to stop. You cannot continue to say things like that against the Speaker.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- I do not take this as your time to try to offend us or even do that.

HON, A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- You said "unbalanced".

HON, RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- You are not.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- You said "unbalanced".

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- The situation is unbalanced because you are sitting down, and then I told you to sit down.

(Chorus of interjections)

So, you are sitting down.

(Laughter)

Madam Speaker, let me reiterate that. Unbalanced because he is sitting down and I am telling him to sit down. So, if you interpret that wrongly, there is something with you or an unbalanced mind.

(Laughter)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Actions speak louder than words!

HON. SPEAKER.- Order, order! Let's not delve any more into the issue, and that was an ice breaker, anyway.

(Laughter)

I now give the floor to the Hon. Ratu Sela Nanovo.

Recent FNPF Assistance (Question No. 67/2016)

HON. RATU S.V. NANOVO asked the Government, upon notice:

Can the Honourable Attorney-General and Minister of Finance, Public Enterprises, Civil Service and Communications advice this House as to what sort of mechanism that the Government has put in place to ensure that the FNPF assistance recently given out to the people of Fiji will be put into good use, especially after witnessing that this assistance has already reached Hong Kong?

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Minister you may disregard the end tail of that question. However, I give the floor to the Honourable Minister.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM (Attorney-General and Minister of Finance, Public Enterprises, Civil Service and Communications).- Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the Honourable Member for his question.

Unfortunately the question is ill-conceived. Whilst I appreciate the Honourable Member's concern about the release of funds by FNPF. FNPF, Madam Speaker, obviously has its own rules and procedures which need to be followed to enable members to withdraw funds from the Fund itself. Once the members withdraw their funds, it is up to the individual member as to how best they will utilise these funds, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Prem Singh, you have the floor.

HON. P. SINGH.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Attorney-General for his answer. I would just like to enquire whether this assistance or this concept will be extended to victims of *Tropical Cyclone Zena*, particularly flooded areas.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you, Honourable Minister.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Member for his question. That is a matter for FNPF to decide and of course they have their own rules. For example, they have various safeguards to protect the system from abuse, and members can only withdraw a total of 30 percent of their funds before the age of 55. The 30 percent of the members' funds can be withdrawn for housing assistance, tertiary education, hospitalisation and assistance for natural disasters. This leaves 70 percent of the funds which can be accessed when the member reaches the age of 55.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you, I give the floor to the Honourable Dulakiverata.

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. In the last Hong Kong game, the message on the TV screen was "Vinaka FNPF", which showed that most of the people who went there used the money they got from FNPF.

HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- How do you know that?

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- The intention of the withdrawal was for the rehabilitation after the hurricane. I ask the Honourable Minister, can you please explain to us if proper scrutinisation of all the applications were done before they were given the money. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Attorney-General.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- I understand where the Honourable Member is coming from because we know that the funds abused took place significantly prior to the reform that was put in place by the Bainimarama Government. In fact, Madam Speaker, international actuaries had said, the manner in which the FNPF funds were being utilised, for example, put down the drain in the development of Natadola which had to be rescued, that the FNPF funds would have finished by 2052. So, I can understand where these questions are coming from.

Madam Speaker, as we have said, various safeguards have now been put in place – the 30 percent requirement. You cannot withdraw anything more than 30 percent and precisely it is one of the reasons why that has been done. Now, in respect of the actual funds that were disbursed because of *Tropical Cyclone Winston*, there were two sets of fund, one could be withdrawn, one was for the emergency fund of \$1,000 and then the other one was for \$5,000. Individual members, as has been advertised in the media, had to sign various declarations and this is precisely also one of the reasons. Madam Speaker, whilst we have the False Information Bill in place, that this House actually approved and is now an Act of Parliament, precisely to address people who may want to abuse it. I saw that sign too and, of course, it does not mean that everyone who withdrew it, abused it. There are a lot of people who did benefit from it, there could be one or two cheeky ones who actually were so cheeky that they thought they could put it up on the screen, but the reality is, at the end of the day, Madam Speaker, this is their own money that they have used, and I can tell you the total amount of funds that has been disbursed by FNPF.

The FNPF, Madam Speaker, processed 180,314 applications and the total paid out is \$272.5 million that FNPF disbursed. Now, this is obviously the members' funds and if they are going to go and make false declarations, obviously that could catch up with them eventually and that is why we need to strengthen our laws. If they are using their own money for a purpose other than what they have stated they want to withdraw the money for, that is on their head, and that is their lack of short-sightedness. This is why we continuously are saying, we need to continue to develop a culture of honesty in Fiji in our everyday lives. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER .- Thank you, I give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Kiliraki.

HON. RATU K. KILIRAKI.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. One of the risks of the superannuation fund of the FNPF is political interference. Having this money accessible which is 30 percent to take care of education, death and housing, most of these applicants have exhausted their 30 percent. What is the Government doing to be able to assist those who have genuinely accessed that fund when they needed it for education assistance or death - \$1,000? Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Honourable Minister and Attorney-General.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. Again like I said, I understand the question by the Honourable Members who are asking questions about the FNPF withdrawals. Madam

Speaker, just about 10 years ago, at one stage, again I go back to the actual report, there was something like 23 reasons for which people could go and withdraw the funds.

Any superannuation fund, Madam Speaker, cannot be treated like a savings bank, it is not like you deposit money and you take it out. It is pooling of funds of all the employees in Fiji for the fund to then make an investment to provide a return on that pooling of funds and which is a form of security for them upon their retirement. But funds throughout the world actually recognise the fact that people do need sometimes, for example, the ability to access those funds to be able to provide for certain basic requirements in life.

Recently, we were in Singapore and in there the contribution is combined the employee contributes 20 percent of their wages and the employer contributes 18 percent of the wages amount. However, the fund in Singapore, because it is so healthy, they actually allow up to 70 percent of withdrawals if people want to buy their own houses. This is why home ownership rate in Singapore is 93 percent.

Madam Speaker, 93 percent of all Singaporeans actually own a title to their home. Madam Speaker, as we discussed in our last Budget announcement, we have given incentives to the private sector to come into that. We want to encourage home ownership, the initiative was put into place by the Honourable Prime Minister, we are now giving grants to people who want to build their first home, we give a \$10,000 grant and if they go through commercial banks, we give a \$5,000 grant and if they want to buy their first home. So there are those facilities available as well.

Similarly, the pressure on FNPF, Madam Speaker, and the members' individual funds has been reduced because now we have things like TELS. Before, people who did not receive scholarships, their parents would have to folk out money from their own pocket. Now, they can actually go out and get TELS and fund their university education without their parents actually having to withdraw the funds from their FNPF which is probably less pressure on it.

Madam Speaker, the reality is that, we now have various mechanisms to ensure that the funds are buffered for the individual members. In respect of when they exhaust the funds, once you exhaust that 30 percent, you cannot go beyond that. So the issue, Madam Speaker, is, we are taking a holistic approach. For example, the person who wants to go and borrow \$1,000, \$2,000 and if they have a report with Data Bureau, they cannot go to commercial banks, so they then go to a money lender. This is what is driving the people on the ground. These are some of the policies and legal changes we are taking place to take a holistic approach to it.

If the member's funds have been exhausted up to 30 percent, they have no opportunity to take out anymore because it is also there for their protection. If we allow them to break that barrier, once they go into that 70 percent, what will happen to them when they retire? We, of course have through the Ministry of Social Welfare now a Pension Scheme for those over the age of 68 for \$50 if they do not have a superannuation fund. So those kinds of social benefits are put there for them, but of course, we need to ensure that they protect their funds.

The last point, I would like to highlight to Honourable Kiliraki, he is talking about the management of the funds, Madam Speaker. I urge Honourable Kiliraki to read the new laws with FNPF. Honourable Kiliraki, I am sure, he is gaining a lot from Honourable Radrodro too, but the point is, if Honourable Kiliraki reads the law, he will find that now the membership of the Board requires different skillsets of people who need to be on the Board. You need, for example, people with legal and accounting backgrounds, you need people with engineering skillsets to have a Board. The whole purpose of the Board is not merely representation, it is the ability and the quality of contribution by the Board members to ensure that the Fund actually does what it is supposed to do.

Now, you can say that previously, only two from the employees, two from the employers and Government, but, Madam Speaker, what kind of skillsets did they bring? Can you have someone who may know how to manage \$4 billion? That is the asset base. You need to have a good cross-section of people bringing good skillsets to the board to provide better governance, not some trade unionist, Madam Speaker, who may only be running a small trade union organisation. What do they know about rate of return on investment? Some of them may know, I am not saying all of them do not know, some of them do know, but is it not better to have a financial expert? Is it not better to have someone with legal proficiency? Is it not better for someone who may have other skillsets that is required for a board that is going to manage \$4 billion worth of assets?

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Suliano Matanitobua to ask his question.

Goodwill Money – Nadarivatu Landowners (Question No. 68/2016)

HON. RATU S. MATANITOBUA asked the Government, upon notice:

Can the Honourable Prime Minister and Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry inform the House why the landowners in Nadarivatu have not received their second goodwill money that was due to have been paid to them for the use of their land for Power Four mini hydro scheme?

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA (Prime Minister, Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry). Thank you, Madam Speaker. I do not know where the Honourable Member got his information from because there is no record in the *iTaukei* Lands about non-payment of funds. Maybe, if he can provide me with the names, have you got any names of any individual landowner who has not been paid?

This is the problem we have, Madam Speaker, that we meet people on the street, and they come up to you and say, "we have not been paid" and you bring that question to the floor in this House but you do not have enough information so that we can solicit appropriate information from the files that we have.

To answer the question, there is no information that we have that payment has not been done. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- I now give the floor to the Honourable Mosese Bulitavu.

Rebuilding of Village Churches/ Halls after TC Winston (Question No. 69/2016)

HON. M.D. BULITAVU asked the Government, upon notice:

Can the Honourable Prime Minister and Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry inform the House as to why Government will not assist in the rebuilding of churches and village halls damaged or destroyed by *Cyclone Winston*?

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA (Prime Minister, Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry).-Madam Speaker, I rise to respond to the question asked by the Honourable Member.

Madam Speaker, last week I heard the Honourable Member tell everyone that he has read our Manifesto. It is a pity that he has not followed the policies of this Government in the last four to five years, he would have known the reasons why we have not done so.

I thank the honourable Member for his question. However, let me inform this august House that as the Prime Minister and a Christian, I respect the important role religion plays in our national life, and they are playing on this, I know that. I know the reason why they came up with this question. People of faith advocate for strong moral principles and keep ethics and good values at the forefront of our national conversation, but in doing so, they make valuable contributions to our nation's future and strengthen our democracy.

We are a multi-faith nation and we have a Constitution that guarantees religious freedom and establishes Fiji as a secular State.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- Answer the question!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Fijians practice many different faiths. It can do so knowing that they are protected under our laws, and that Government does not favour any one religion over another. Government must, of course, remain principled as well and stand for equality, and for the values enshrined in our Constitution, and that includes our function as a secular State. That means, giving no preference to any one faith over another, and creating a society where all religions can peacefully co-exist.

Madam Speaker, Christians, Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs and other denominations can all practice freely in Fiji, and Government has no bias towards or prejudice against any religious identity. This is the point that the Opposition misses completely.

The Opposition's question inherently disregards our Constitution and demonstrates a lack of understanding of the separation between the function of Government and the function of religious bodies in Fiji.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- Answer the question!

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Listen!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- What of the mosques and temples that suffered damages? Are those also the responsibility of Government to rebuild? What other various denominations of Christianity are practised in the country? Do we build only Methodist churches? Why not Catholics, Anglicans, Jehovah's Witness, Seventh-Day Adventists or any other sects of Christianity that exist in Fiji?

Madam Speaker, Government is not in the position to decide whose churches are worthy of rebuilding because it is not Government's job to rebuild any house of religion in Fiji. While the majority of Fijians, including myself are Christians, we are not a Christian State. It would, therefore, be unfair to rebuild churches while leaving other places of worship unattended to.

Madam Speaker, the Opposition has made the intention to make Fiji a Christian State clear on many occasions, however that platform was something rejected by the Fijian people at the polls in 2014.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Hear, hear!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- On the other hand, the FijiFirst Government protects all faiths equally, and does not favour any one religion over another. I revere our places of worship as much as any Christian, but I respect the rights enshrined in our Constitution. My Government's priority is on restoring the buildings and services that benefit all Fijians; our homes, schools, roads, jetties and our hospitals. That is the priority right now, Madam Speaker. With our limited resources, these are the areas where assistance must be targeted.

Madam Speaker, what would the Opposition prefer? That while many thousands of Fijians do not have roofs over their heads, Government should spend its time and money rebuilding every place of worship in Fiji?

Madam Speaker, we have not even heard that relief money disbursed through the FNPF is being given by some Fijians to their churches as donations. Surely, after years of receiving similar donations from the communities, these churches are more capable of financing their own repairs than the many distraught families of Fiji who are currently without homes or the children who are without schools. These are the areas that Government is focussed on, Madam Speaker. We are working to restore the lives of every Fijian affected by the cyclone, regardless of the religion they practise. It is the communities that should be responsible for rebuilding their places of worship and their village halls, and it is up to Government to take on that rebuilding project that impact the lives of every Fijian.

That is why every dollar spent on the relief effort will continue to go towards all the needs of our people, not towards any one religious group. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Supplementary question, Honourable Bulitavu.

HON. M.D. BULITAVU.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. The Honourable Prime Minister has really gone to another issue on that.

My question to the Honourable Prime Minister, Madam Speaker, given that he has just returned from signing the *Paris Agreement* and now that we have a scheme called the "Adopt the School Scheme", can Government reconsider its position to also adopt a village scheme because those two things (the hall and the church) are in the village and that will benefit our rural community? Can the Government reconsider its position, given that he was in Paris, there are global climate funds that are there that help the Government in the adaptation programmes, especially on the issue of climate change?

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.-Madam Speaker, I think I have given my answer to that in the last five minutes.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Kiliraki.

HON. RATU K. KILIRAKI.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think the Honourable Prime Minister did not answer the subject of the question in regards to the halls and churches that were destroyed in the cyclone areas, and from the Honourable Minister of Education, these churches are used for education, teaching and even some evacuation centres where they sought refuge because that is the only place where they find that it is safe. That should be in the total answer for the Hon. Prime Minister.

My question is, whether the Hon. Prime Minister and the Government could address this situation?

HON. SPEAKER.- I now give the floor to the Honourable Prime Minister.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Yes, they have been answered, Madam Speaker. *Dou taroga mada ga na taro vinaka?* 

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Dulakiverata.

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- Hon. Speaker, I thank the Honourable Prime Minister for his answer. The problem is, because it was done by the previous government, they do not want to do it. The intention of previous governments that build churches and community halls in the villages was very noble because they are used for these purposes, for evacuation centres.

My question to the Hon. Prime Minister, can he reconsider his Government's policy ...

(Chorus of interjections)

... for this logical reason that these halls and churches are used for rehabilitation centres during times of disasters?

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Honourable Prime Minister.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Madam Speaker, just let me say that most of these churches that Hon. Dulakiverata is talking about, they are built because of votes. That is just basically what it was done for votes.

HON. MEMBERS.- Oh!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA- That is true.

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- That is not true.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Madam Speaker, that is true and then over the years....

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- If you can get them to shut up and listen, maybe I can explain this.

Over the years, because people have now questioned previous governments building churches, then that was changed to evacuation centres.

(Hon Members interjected)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- The churches have now been turned as evacuation centres so that they can justify the building of these churches but basically it was done for political motive to get votes. So the answer to that question, I am not here to get votes. I am here to give justice to the people of Fiji and it takes a little bit of guts to do that. Thank you.

(Hon. Members interjected)

# Written Questions

Confirmation of Assistance by Australia & New Zealand Governments (Question No. 70/2016)

HON. M.D. BULITAVU asked the Government, upon notice:

Can the Honourable Minister for Agriculture, Rural and Maritime Development and National Disaster Management confirm to the House that without the assistance by the Governments of Australia and New Zealand post-Cyclone Winston, the Fiji Government would not have been able to respond as quickly to the severely affected areas?

HON. LT. COL. I.B. SERUIRATU. (Minister for Agriculture, Rural and Maritime Development and National Disaster Management).- Thank you, Madam Speaker, I acknowledge the question but, our request is permitted under Standing Order 45(3), if I can table my answer at a later date. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Special Cane Payments (Question No. 71/2016)

HON. PROF. B. C. PRASAD asked the Government, upon notice:

Would the Honourable Prime Minister and Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry inform the House of the following:

- (i) Were two special cane payments of \$2 and \$2.80 given to cane growers in November 2015 and January 2016, deducted by the Fiji Sugar Corporation from the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Cane payment being from proceeds for the 2015 harvesting and crushing season; and
- (ii) Without the deduction of \$3.40 being balance of the special cane payment, from the 3<sup>rd</sup> cane payment in March 2016, would the total payment per tonne of cane be \$13.28 instead of \$9.88 per tonne?

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA (Prime Minister and Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry).- Madam Speaker, I will table my answer at a later date, as permitted under Standing Orders 45(3).

#### Written response - Question No. 49/2016

HON. SPEAKER.- I will now call upon Honourable Minister for Defence, National Security and Immigration to table his written response.

HON. CAPT. T.L. NATUVA.- Madam Speaker, pursuant to Standing Order 45(5), I hereby table my written response to a supplementary question to Question No. 49/2016 which was asked by Hon. Ratu Kiniviliame Kiliraki and recorded on page 1423 of the *Daily Hansard* of Wednesday, 27th April, 2016.<sup>1</sup>

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you, please hand your written response to the Secretary-General.

(Written response handed to the Secretary-General)

Thank you, that brings to the end our question time. We will now go on to the next item on the Order Paper, Motions for Debate.

#### **COMBATTING HUMAN TRAFFICKING**

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Madam Speaker, I rise to move a motion under my name:

That in light of the growing global issue of human trafficking and its human, social and economic destructive consequences, that Parliament condemns human trafficking as a form of forced and bonded labour and acknowledge the efforts by the Government so far to combat trafficking and calls for –

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Editor's Note

- a) vigorous Government action to raise awareness through mass media campaigns; and
- b) reviewing current policies like Immigration and Border Control Policies in order to prevent and eradicate human trafficking in Fiji.

HON. RATU S.V. NANOVO.- Madam Speaker, I beg to second the motion.

HON. SPEAKER.- I invite the Honourable Salote Radrodro to speak on her motion.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, before I speak on my motion, I also take this opportunity to acknowledge the politics students from the University of the South Pacific and the Professor who are in the gallery.

I also I take this opportunity to wish the students and schools taking part in the Coke Games today and tomorrow, particularly the girls from the *Ruku ni Veidakua* and their cheering squad, the *Waimanu Kui*, who will be loud in the Stadium today to reach Waimanu and Sawani. May the best team win!

Madam Speaker, this motion was to have been heard in this House in August 2015 but it was shelved. The Opposition had initially tabled two motions for today which, in our view, is of national importance and very relevant to Fiji's situation, particularly after *Tropical Cyclone Winston* and the devastating effects. Unfortunately, it has been disallowed by the Business Committee and somehow, I welcome this opportunity to speak on this motion which is a replacement motion.

Madam Speaker, Fiji is ranked as a Tier Two in the trafficking of citizens as according to the 2014 US State Department Trafficking in Persons Report. Tier two ranking included countries whose government do not fully comply with the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, but are seen to be making significant efforts to comply with the set standards.

Madam Speaker, the US State Department Report stated that Fiji is a source country for children subjected to sex trafficking and forced labour, and a destination country for Asian men and women subjected to forced labour and forced prostitution.

HON. A.T. VADEL- No border control.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Madam Speaker, this Report was a consolidation of information from Government, Non-Government Agencies, news reports, academic studies and researches, and recommended that:

- 1) Fiji should continue with its efforts to investigate, prosecute trafficking offences and convict and punish traffickers.
- 2) Additional training for law enforcement and immigration officers on victim identification and protection to be instituted.

Madam Speaker, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime reported that child trafficking alone has increased by 5 percent since 2010, with girls and women accounting for 70 percent of the victims worldwide. Madam Speaker, I am of the view that one of the reasons we have these cases of human trafficking in the country is because of our weak border controls.

Madam Speaker, Fiji has very liberal visa arrangement where 132 countries can come into Fiji without a visa. Furthermore, Fiji's role as a regional transportation hub makes it a potential transit area for human trafficking. Madam Speaker, the first human trafficking prosecution was brought forward by the

State in 2010, which was the same year that the Crimes Decree came into force and which introduced Fiji's anti-human trafficking laws. The second prosecution was brought in in late 2012, and the third concluded in June, 2014.

Madam Speaker, at the 16th Attorney General's Conference in December 2014, a paper was presented by the Director of Public Prosecution on human trafficking in Fiji, and he had identified some of the challenges faced by the prosecution, and some of which were:

- 1) How to persuade the victims to stay in Fiji, to give evidence?
- 2) There was no power given to the Police to detain witnesses, if they have committed no offence.
- 3) Although technically, the victims may have committed an offence in entering Fiji, by making a false declaration, it would have been inappropriate to prosecute them for this offence merely to keep them in Fiji in order to give evidence in another case.
- 4) The issue of victims as witnesses in trials continue to cause difficulties for the prosecution, particularly in human trafficking cases, since the victims are usually from overseas and have no support base.
- 5) Victims may be psychologically or physically harmed, that they have experienced threats and violence, that they are suffering from post-traumatic stress disorder, and that they may prefer not to give evidence against the alleged traffickers.
- 6) Children also require special consideration, not only because of their innate vulnerability, but also because their parents are often complicit in their trafficking and exploitation.

Madam Speaker, I would urge Government to identify best practices in countries like Australia and New Zealand, and in other Asian countries on how they investigate, prosecute trafficking offences, and convict and punish traffickers.

Madam speaker, whist I recognise the work undertaken by the Government entities and the Anti-Human Trafficking Taskforce, I wish to call for new and additional resources to be made available, that would provide for additional training for law enforcement and immigration officers on victim identification and protection to be instituted. Madam Speaker, I ask through this motion that Parliament urgently build structures that look into creating awareness on human trafficking, and that relevant Committees each initiate work that explore the vulnerability of Fiji to this most heinous crime whilst promoting ways to strengthen our laws against those who dare to practice this crime within our borders.

Madam Speaker, I commend this motion to this House, that in light of the growing global issue of human trafficking and its human, social and economic destructive consequences, Parliament condemns human trafficking as a form of forced and bonded labour, acknowledge the efforts by Government so far to combat trafficking, and calls for:

- 1) Vigorous Government action to raise awareness through mass media campaigns; and
- 2) Review current policies like immigration and border control policies, in order to prevent and eradicate human trafficking in Fiji.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. The motion is now open for debate. I give the floor to the Honourable Dulakiverata.

HON. J. DULAKIVERATA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, I stand to contribute to the motion before the House. Human Trafficking is a very serious topic, not only in Fiji but around the world today. As we know, Madam Speaker, our country is an island nation country that is surrounded by water and it is vulnerable to trafficking. I just want to make a comment, Madam Speaker, that a country that protects its sovereignty and citizens is one that protects its borders. I think, Madam Speaker, that is one of the areas that we should build and enhance to protect this human trafficking.

Human trafficking, Madam Speaker, is not a new thing, it had been done in the past during the Colonial times through blackbirding, slavery and even during the indentured season. People were being forced to leave their country to go and work in other places without being given the right reasons, and some were lured for greener pastures but turned out to be the opposite.

Madam Speaker, we have in Fiji policies, such as the immigration policy that had been alluded to by my colleague regarding free visa which are given to 135 countries visa free when entering Fiji, and this could be used as a way of trafficking people into the country. The Government is always boasting about making Fiji as the hub of the Pacific, but I think, Madam Speaker, by having that, we are also inviting a lot of other problems which I think we do not have the solutions or resources to take care of this influx of people, who would use this hub to come to Fiji.

Madam Speaker, one of the Bills that we had adopted yesterday, the Adoption Bill, could also be legally used for human trafficking. I think, Madam Speaker, this Government should pass laws, and we are here in this House to pass laws for the benefit of everyone.

If we look at it on the narrow passage of how we have been passing some of the Bills, we will never achieve the objectives of the laws that we make. Most of the laws that we have had before, they had stood and weathered the passage of time and took very long to be amended. One example is our Standing Order, Madam Speaker, that we have only had it for two years, we have had three amendments. This is because, I think the interest of everyone is not being taken care of. It is only if the laws are only made to protect or for the benefit of a few, then it will not play its role in the development of society.

Madam Speaker, some of the policies that we have at the moment, some of the overseas contractors, they come here, they bring their own labourers, we do not know because we do not understand their language, we do not know how these people have been coerced to come here, come and live here and how their salaries are being paid; no one really wants to know what is going on. So this could be a way that contributes to this business of human trafficking, Madam Speaker.

So, I support this motion, Madam Speaker, that the Government should seriously look into this and have appropriate laws to address the issue. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Minister for Lands.

HON. M.R. VUNIWAQA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker, for the opportunity to make a short contribution to the motion at hand. I heard with interest a suggestion that Fiji should come up with laws to regulate this area of criminal activity in our country. I refer the Honourable Member to Section 10 of our Constitution which says, and I quote:

"10 (1).- A person must not be held in slavery or servitude, or subjected to forced labour or human trafficking."

That, Madam Speaker, is the platform for the creation of laws relating to human trafficking in Fiji. I further refer to our Crimes Decree 2009 which the Honourable Salote Radrodro had very briefly referred to in her motion.

The said Crimes Decree specifically creates offences of trafficking in people, trafficking in children, domestic trafficking in people and children, debt bondage, sexual servitude and people smuggling. Following the enforcement of the 2009 Crimes Decree which came into force in 2010, there was extensive training for prosecutors, police and the judiciary as well. That led to the successful prosecution of traffickers, people smugglers in Fiji.

As with any other law, we already have the platform, there may be need for raised public awareness on the issue, but I do believe that the legal platform we already have in our Constitution and in our criminal laws is sufficient to tackle the issue on the legal platform. That, Madam Speaker, is my contribution to the motion. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Minister for Defence.

HON. CAPT. T.L. NATUVA.- Madam Speaker, and Members of Parliament, I do not agree with the motion because Government already has in place initiatives. I will just mention a few. The Government has comprehensive anti-trafficking laws in place. The Crimes Decree defines human trafficking as a crime. In the past three years, Government has conducted anti-trafficking training for law enforcements in Fiji and they have also been attending anti-trafficking courses overseas.

We also engaged the media in identifying the issue. I think there was also a success in prosecution of human trafficking in 2010. I do not have the data with me, but I can present it to you later, if you want. What I want to stress is that, we have in place initiatives by Government on the issue, we are not sitting on our backs and not caring about it. I do not agree with the motion because we have Government initiatives already working on the issue. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Minister for Education.

HON. DR. M. REDDY.- Madam Speaker, I have a problem with the motion. Part (a), Fiji is a bit of a conservative society and if you do this, we will create a panic mode amongst our children, particularly when parents are dropping children to school and picking them up. The danger is that, that will disrupt that activity of dropping children or children walking to school or coming back to school.

Madam Speaker, at the moment we have a subject where we do talk about it, we can have more oratory contests, et cetera, amongst our children, but to take on board the suggestion that has been made could create a major panic status amongst our children and parents in particular and that will disrupt the whole education activity. So, Madam Speaker, I do not think we should get into this. What we are doing now is strengthening the activity that we are doing now. I do not think we have gone to that stage where we get into a massive mass media campaign. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Isoa Tikoca.

HON. RATU I.D. TIKOCA.- Madam Speaker, I rise to contribute to the motion before the House. There are continual critical leaks that we continue to allow to promote illegal entries into our nation. Some of the commercial leaks, if you look at the recent Bill that we discussed yesterday, we

are so concerned about the data on the Bureau initiative by Government to support a hideous intention that is criminal in nature. This is outrageous and it is affecting the banks and all the lending agencies, so we need to protect those leaks.

One of the major leaks that we are concerned about is the entries from all our entry points and exit points. We are an island of 300 islands and we have major ports in Labasa, Lautoka and, of course, in Suva and likewise, the international airports. We have private airports and we also own a number of type of airports operating in our country. I bring this issue because this is happening already in the human traffic into our country.

The sad thing is human trafficking is engineered sometimes within, exactly the same as when we see the *Girmit* when they came to Fiji. It started off with slavery with the blackbirders and when slavery was stopped, *Girmit* began although the *Girmit* or Indentured Persons or unemployment, with an employment contract under this system, this is preserving the mere of respectability. More than 100 percent of Indian labourers came through this system, but they came with a lot of problems because they were mistreated and they were uncertain where were they were going. When they settled, they began to grow and they are part of this country and we welcome that very much. But bad and wrong business intentions for the betterment of only a few who entertain and given some legality into it, to allow them but they were mistreated.

However, what is happening here in Fiji and likewise most of the countries, entries into our countries can be political motivated if we do not watch entry points into our country or many other areas, we now see a lot of Chinese. They came with some business intention but what is their contribution to our economic growth? We know for sure that at odd hours in the morning, gambling is part of these activities. We are entertaining them, these are trafficking people and they come also with women and young girls. These are the people that are selling themselves around here for the benefit of others.

So, if you are saying that you are not supporting it, why? We should increase the degree of our alertness, to ensure that we do not mistreat people that comes into our nation that we look after our peoples so that they are not sucked into this trade and we must make sure that we keep the decency and the sovereignty of our nation. That is the problem that we are facing right now. We are looking at issues that is growing outside and sometimes political in nature, because these people can be hired for other things. People come in with contractual arrangements then after that we fulfil the time of staying here they do otherwise. They are not monitored, right now, I will ask the Honourable Minister for Defence if he can locate these people around our country?

It is difficult to monitor them, it is difficult to understand where they are going? So, that is all part of the trafficking. We put some legal boundaries into it, they are qualified into entering and therefore, after they settle they become problem in our nation. That is visible and continue to be visible at night and late hours of the morning. That is why we request that this august House do consider this concern and apply some more powers into ensuring that we police trafficking of people that comes in with different intention. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Attorney-General.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I would like to thank the contributions from the Honourable Members. Just very briefly, as many of the Honourable Members including the Honourable Minister for Defence and the Honourable Minister for Lands have made the salient points, in particular regarding the legal framework within which the Ministry operates.

Madam Speaker, the Honourable Salote Radrodro very succinctly in certain parts of her presentation did highlight the fact that human trafficking is a very pernicious crime. It is also very insidious

Madam Speaker. Fiji, of course, is not the hotbed of human trafficking. There are countries in Europe, UK we have seen on television where they opened up containers and there are hundreds of people filled in one container. In some of them, they obviously die from suffocation, others have travel long periods of distances. There are women being trafficked, in particular from Eastern Europe to the richer part of Europe and other parts of the world, essentially to be put in sexual slavery.

Madam Speaker, the reality is that, it is a worldwide problem. Honourable Salote Radrodro talked about tier two, she failed to mention that we used to be tier three. In fact, we were not even in any of the tiers at one point in time. So, we have improved from tier three to tier two and you cannot flick your finger or just have some committee in Parliament and take it up to tier one, it will not do that. It is an implementation of the laws, it is enforcement of the laws and it is the monitoring of controls that Honourable Tikoca talks about the border. Borders tend to be porous at times.

I just read an article yesterday in the UK, just a few days ago their entire Immigration system has collapsed. They had over 100,000 people who entered UK without being screened. That is in the newspaper, Madam Speaker.

The point is, Madam Speaker, that all countries face these issues; whether it is the border down South in USA from Mexico and whether it is humans being trafficked from Eastern Europe to Western Europe. These are the kind of things that are taking place. What is the real test; the test is whether there is the administrative and the political will to firstly put in place the regulatory framework and the second stage, of course, Madam Speaker, is do you have the capacity, both in terms of the human resource capacity and the resources that is required. That is the real test.

Madam Speaker, for the benefit of this House, I hold out the various pamphlets that are actually now available at the border, you have pamphlets in the Thailand language, English and Putonghua or Mandarin language that is put at the border, to essentially alert people. As the Honourable Minister had highlighted we have a number of cases all one in particular with human trafficking cases where some Thai women were brought in by some people and basically, being used for prostitution.

The issues that Honourable Salote Radrodro highlighted the DPP's Office, there are issues not only faced in Fiji's, it is everywhere in the world. All these people who are trafficked are very, very vulnerable. All of these people who are trafficked, they sometimes do not want to become witnesses because they are fearful. Sometimes they have family members maybe held captive because we do not know the countries they come from and the conditions and she is absolutely right. Now, you would see as the Honourable Minister has highlighted a number of policy measures have been taking place, administrative measures, where now the DPP is able to better look after these witnesses and keep them for a period of time. Because sometimes what actually happens is, when these people are brought in and we discover that they have been used as sexual slave or whatever the case maybe, and you want to use them as witnesses, the trial maybe in six months' time, their visa are also expired by that time.

There is a number of administrative issues with the DPP, the Director of Immigrations Office and all the other agencies need to deal with. It is not a matter that can be run by some committee in Parliament. It requires people on the ground, we have heard, Madam Speaker, in the past few years, recent times, training by the USA State Department that offers training to DPP's Office and the various Immigration Officers, in terms of building up the capacity, the ability to recognise perhaps, what are signs if someone entering at the border and how do you pick this up? Sometimes people even obtain a visa but they are not coming into Fiji for the purpose of witness state that they would come into Fiji for.

We have also, Madam Speaker, put a wide range of publications and you see these outside about various posters and banners about "debt bondage". "I am not for sale, we have a child here," and again posters on human trafficking. All of these is made available, Madam Speaker, all of these have been used.

Madam Speaker, there is also a difference between what Honourable Tikoca had mentioned, I completely agree with him, in terms of the Immigration laws but that is different to human trafficking. When someone comes legally for a particular purpose in the country and they are fulfilling the purpose, if they are going to stab someone in a nightclub, that does not falling in the ambit of human trafficking. Human trafficking is when you are trafficking human beings for illegal activities without their consent, keeping them in bondage. That is what human trafficking means.

Madam Speaker, there has also recently been internal cases of human trafficking. There is a famous case now, a well-known case, should I say a 2014 case, *State vs Raikadroka*. This is where young Fijian girls were being used by this Fijian man who was trafficking them and being used for prostitution also.

Madam Speaker, we need to look at the Honourable Minister for Lands talked about the Crimes Decree. We need to be able to for example, Madam Speaker, have a very, very robust and contemporary piece of legislation. The Crimes Decree is that contemporary piece of legislation. We have the Penal Code prior to 2009, which is almost a hundred years old, which we got from Queensland by default of the fact that we were a British Colony. It had not changed, for example rules of corroboration regarding rape were still there. The definition of rape and sexual assault was very, very limited, it was only gender specific. Remember that young boys now get traffic too. So, there is a lot of sick people out there.

Madam Speaker, the Crimes Decree has in fact been updated in that sense. This is all graphic stuff but previously, rape was only the insertion of penis in the vagina. Now, rape is a lot more extensive than that. Definition of sexual assault is also more extensive than that. So, our laws have been modernised. As the Honourable Minister for Lands has highlighted we have constitutional provisions which makes it incumbent upon this Parliament to ensure that they fulfil the provisions of those constitutional provisions.

Madam Speaker, there are a couple of other cases that I could mention. There was this famous case where three young Thai women were recruited in Thailand for a week of massage work in Fiji. When they came to Fiji, their passports were taken and they were forced to provide sexual services during their stay. I cannot pronounce this name very well. It was Laojindamanee and these people were of course successfully prosecuted for these offences.

Then we had another case called *Bing vs State*, again in 2014, Madam Speaker, where we had prison sentences of 10 years being given and a minimum term of 9 years had to be served.

Then we had another case of *Murti vs State*, where there were seven Indians who were trafficked. They were told that they were going to work in a farm in New Zealand but brought into Fiji and they remained here because they could not get into New Zealand. These people again took a lot of money and Murti, I understand, went in for a period of 6 years.

Madam Speaker, the reality is that there is a lot of work that is being carried out, in particular by the Honourable Minister for Defence's Ministry. In respect of this, there is a lot of Intel work that goes behind the scenes. They need to gather information from our counterparts. These once too here, there is a lot of underground work, Intel work that takes place. They talk to their Australian, New Zealand and other counterparts and INTERPOL does get involved. So, Madam Speaker, it is also by intelligence gathering for us to be effective. It is an operational manner that cannot be brought through a Committee.

I think we all agree in this House that human trafficking is a very serious crime, it is an insidious crime and it is a removal of an individual's dignity. I mean to actually treat a person and think that they are your property is one of the awful things that any person can think of. So, Madam Speaker, we all agree with that, as I have said, we have launched a huge campaign on this, a lot of work goes behind the scenes, we talk to the various women's organisations and tie up with the various NGOs to be able to provide that support and I understand some of them have been giving counselling too.

The DPP's Office is also strengthening its provisions and the issues that are highlighted and of course, Madam Speaker, when all of these agencies make their submission for budgetary allocations, they highlight these issues. They never have re shirked away from saying, "no, no, we will cut your budget regarding human trafficking." Those resources are being made available, Madam Speaker, and our laws, as we said, have been adequately reviewed.

We will constantly work with all our development partners to ensure that we are in line with international best practices. No country is perfect, I am not saying that should be an excuse for us, but we will constantly work to fulfil any gaps, there needs to be some gap analysis done, we need to build the capacity, we need to build local capacity in terms of being able to speak the different languages because I know one of the issues that they faced, when those Thai ladies came, they had to quickly actually run around and find someone who could speak in Thai. This is a very critical everyday appraisal issues. My point is, notwithstanding the philosophical rational behind Honourable Radrodro's motion, the point is Madam Speaker, if that is not something that the Committee can do. We all support and I think if we had a motion before the floor for us to all condemn human trafficking, we will all have a unanimous decision. We will all condemn it but to be able to then say, let us get some Committee in Parliament to run it, is not appropriate.

If for example, as the Honourable Minister for Education said that our children were being whisked away on a daily basis, nabbed off the streets and being sold off, then of course it becomes a national issue also and then Parliament can perhaps look at that but we have not reached that stage.

We need to be able to ensure, I mean if you look at a country like Singapore, it has a number of huge checks and balances but it is not in your face. Their airport is probably one of the safest airports but you do not have people walking around with M16s in the airports. Some airports do that, so there is also a lot of currency if you are able to ensure that you enforce the laws, without it being in your face and without creating a panic because we also need to ensure that we maintain the commercial ability for business et cetera, engage in, Madam Speaker, so therefore in principle I speak against this motion.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I now give the floor to the Honourable Ratu Kiliraki.

HON. RATU K. KILIRAKI.- Thank you, Madam Speaker, may I make a contribution to this motion.. I would like to say that as many Bills we put in the House, as many development policies, we are trying to address men. Men making laws and all of these policies and developments to address men and as many Bills show, it shows the failure of our trying to address all these issues, in regards to men. So many Bills that we have passed, Code of Ethics, it just shows the corruption of men to be able to be addressed by men in these issues.

Honourable Dulakiverata quoted the Ten Commandments and in fact, the reply from there, accusing him of not complying to the Ten Commandments. As you point one finger, Madam Speaker, there are four or three pointing against you.

(Chorus of interjections)

To address men, Madam Speaker, you have a spirit that you have your relationship with God and that must come first because when you summarise in two sentences the Ten Commandments, "you love God with all your heart, with all your spirit, with all your strength and with all your soul and love your man as you love yourself."

Those are the two main fundamental principles that we are trying to address, and as alluded to by Honourable Radrodro, it has to come from the heart, whatever comes from the heart will show in yourself to be visible to men. If the spirit of the Lord dwells in your heart, you will manifest what God wants you to be and it has to be visible. Unfortunately, the Honourable Prime Minister denies to voice the name of Jesus Christ according to his faith, but I will quote from the *Bible*, from Mathew 10: 32: "those who declare my name publicly that they belong to me, I will do the same for them before my Father in Heaven but those who reject me publicly, I will reject before my Father in Heaven."

#### HON. OPPOSITION MEMBERS.- Amen!

HON. RATU K. KILIRAKI.- So to address the soul and address the physical needs of the soul, it has to have a proper relationship with God and that is the essence of this, and that the moral being of men is falling and these are attributed to economic needs, poverty, over crowdedness, shifting from rural to urban and the people need money to satisfy the physical need. You know that the love of money is the root of all evils which is according to the *Bible* ...

(Chorus of interjections)

... and leads to corruption and leads to every evils of men which we are trying to address by law of men.

So that is the whole issue, Madam Speaker, so probably awareness should be focused on these issues and to address economic and the vulnerability of people in poverty, overcrowding and migration and that should be the focus. If we address these issues, especially the moral issues, Madam Speaker, all these laws will be tabled in the House to address issues like human trafficking. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Minister for Agriculture.

HON. LT. COL. I.B. SERUIRATU.- Thank you, Madam Speaker, my short contribution will only focus on a few areas. One is the reliability of information. Madam Speaker, the Honourable Dulakiverata would know this very well, he worked in the Intelligence Cell of the Military in 1987.

(Chorus of interjections)

Information comes from all different directions but there is a difference between information and intelligence, you need to analyse your information. You will need to identify the facts out of the bundle of information that you have. Then intelligence becomes reliable and it leads you to the facts.

Let us not react to every information, Madam Speaker. So, there is a big danger when this group gives us this report. We need to scrutinise, analyse to get the facts out of it and then we look at what we have in place. This is one of the arguments from one of the sources of information that is mentioned in the motion before the House.

Again, it is a global phenomenon, Madam Speaker. This is a globalised world, open borders, free trade, and these are the things that are expected to be happening, but is Government aware? Yes, Government is aware. However, we need to look at our systems that are in place as well, Madam Speaker. Are the systems working? Yes, the systems are working, but we need to build capacity, we need to give the technology, we need to equip our people so that they can continue to be effective and efficient in combating this crime, Madam Speaker.

I, for one, am satisfied because only a few years back, I visited one of our top farmers in Fiji. I will not mention his name. I was surprised that only after a year, this farmer is now in Korovou out of this very offence. So, our systems are working. Of course, we have cross borders, but it does not mean we look at the incidents that are coming in, but what are the number of arrests made? There are so many arrests made.

Even in immigration issues, Madam Speaker, Government has four State-run Detention Centres at this stage which tells us that the systems in placed are already effective, it is just a bit of capacity building, it will bring efficiency, Madam Speaker. So, particularly at this stage, we need to weigh this against the other advantages.

Madam Speaker, we are a developing country, we need employment, we need trade, so these are things that need to be weighed and, of course, Madam Speaker, let us not react to every information. Let us trust the systems that are in place. Of course, Fiji is not the only country facing this, but how can we do it better? Of course, through the systems that we have. I also wish to make this final comment, Madam Speaker, we are part of a regional and global network. Interpol is quite effective, Madam Speaker. Only a few years back, Madam Speaker, methamphetamine was seized and people who were responsible for it were arrested. This was information from Interpol. Illegal cigarettes being sold in Fiji, this was intelligence information brought into the country through Interpol, so we are part of the global and regional network, and of course, we are doing our very best to combat this.

I strongly think that the motion is not necessary.

HON. SPEAKER.- I now give the floor to the Hon. Bulitavu.

HON. M.D. BULITAVU.- Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Minister for Agriculture and Minister for Rural and Maritime Development for supporting the motion.

My small contribution to the debate on the motion which is before the House is that, the motion is quite simple on what it seeks and the main issue for Government is to have vigorous actions on awareness and mass media awareness, and also for the Immigration and Border Control policies to be reviewed because of the needs that are there, given the crimes that have come up in relation to human trafficking.

Madam Speaker, in 2015, the United States Department of State Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report was released and it specifically said that Fiji does not fully comply with the minimum standards for elimination of trafficking. Despite Fiji making significant efforts, Madam Speaker, in terms of laws, prosecution and investigation, one of the problems that was identified was that, our authorities did not widely implement formal procedures to proactively identify victims of trafficking amongst the vulnerable population during the year. This is something, Madam Speaker, that our general population needs to know, the need for a wide and vigorous campaign in regards to this particular issue so that our citizens who could be victims of a growing industry that is there, is not enough. People need to know how they will be involved. The laws are there and they are deterrents but the prayers of the motion is quite simple, how the Government can create more awareness. Most of the pictures that are here, Madam Speaker, are not Fijians.

So, we need to have those, Madam Speaker, because we have many businesses we are not sure the type of businesses they operate on. I will give you an example. There is a new massage parlour being opened in Labasa, Madam Speaker..

HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- What for?

(Laughter)

HON. M.D. BULITAVU.- The Honourable Minister will know.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. M.D. BULITAVU.- Listen, I will come to that!

The problem, Madam Speaker, is that, that particular business was opened for the benefit of the Chinese workers that came to work for the Nawailevu bauxite because it is part of their tradition and part of their activities. However, that particular business is now being used by our locals as well, and we saw a problem there. When you bring in development without proper checks and without foresight, Madam Speaker, these are the likely problems that could come with it.

The Honourable Minister for Rural Development will know that now there are children who are born in Nawailevu looking Chinese. He knows that. It came through village meetings and *tikina* meetings, but those are some of the effects that do come out when we do not properly monitor developments and things we bring into our country in regards to that. However, I urge the Honourable Minister for Defence to take heed of the advice given by the United States State Department in regards to proper implementation of formal procedures, and to be proactive in identifying victims, et cetera.

With those, Madam Speaker, I see a need to have this motion supported by both sides of the House, so that we can increase the campaign because we do not have a society which knows all the Decrees and Constitutions. This is also written in English, so we need this to be translated into the different vernaculars and given to our people so that they can understand the importance of this particular problem to our people, not only foreigners who use Fiji as a hub but our citizens as wel who could be trafficked out of the country in this regards to this Bill.

With that, Madam Speaker, I support the motion that is before the House.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Hon. Vunivalu.

HON. S.B. VUNIVALU.- Madam Speaker, I also want to make a contribution in regards to the motion by the Honourable Salote Radrodro. As earlier commented by the Honourable Ratu Kiliraki, who even held a *Bible* this morning, I want to say in this Honourable House that even some of the pastors who say their religious are committing the serious crime of rape.

(Chorus of interjections)

Madam Speaker, for those who want to come to Fiji, they have to apply for their visa, checked properly at whichever airport and the border controls are there. It is not written there, "We are coming for trafficking", no. They are coming here for other things – business; that is why they are here.

(Inaudible interjection)

You have mentioned that you went to one massage parlour in Labasa.

(Laughter)

HON. M.D. BULITAVU.- It is a talk of the town. It is a concern of the town.

HON. S.B. VUNIVALU.- Madam Speaker, prostitution or whoever is suspected of doing such an offence can only be proven guilty in a Court of law. However, if it is just all hearsay from Honourable Dulakiverata who has being around the world, I heard him telling someone that he went to New Zealand and saw some trafficking there, I do not know.

(Laughter)

The police are here, that is why they are doing the work. Madam Speaker, I do not support this motion. Thank you.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. I give the floor to the Honourable Minister for Health and Medical Services.

HON. J. USAMATE.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. I think the issue of human trafficking is something that we all abhor. It is something that we do not want to see in our country, it is something that we do not to see happening to members of our families and the communities that we live in. It is something that has been expressed in this House is something that is now seen all over the world, in all countries basically. But I think as the Honourable Attorney-General has mentioned, if you look at the extent to which it is happening in our country, it is far less than what is happening in other countries.

From the discussions that we have had so far, and the contributions that have been made by the Honourable Minister for Lands, Honourable Minister for National Defence and the Honourable Attorney-General, it is clear that there is legal framework to deal with these issues. It is clear that there is Crimes Decree, it has been clear from the history of prosecutions that we have had, that that there has been a lot of progress on it. As being mentioned about the report that has put together by the Americans, they might have identified the areas that are opportunities for improvement.

What I can say, that in all the Government departments that we have, whether that it is in immigration which looks at our borders, there is always an ongoing process to review the processes that we have, there is an ongoing attempt to make sure that we continuously improve. The second part of the motion talks about reviewing current policies like immigration and border control policies in order to prevent and eradicate human trafficking in Fiji. This is already in motion, there are already developments to develop our national security strategy, development of our white paper on immigration. So, all of these issues are already in place, there is no need to be able to come up with something new to complement the things that are already happening.

In terms of the first part of the motion which talks about vigorous Government actions to raise awareness through mass awareness media campaigns, those thing are already in operation, they are already happening.

Today we have been given the posters that are here, it has been mentioned also that these would be provided also in the vernacular. There is already a lot of collaboration that is going on between Government and other NGOs or civil society that is involved in this to make sure that people are aware of it.

So, what I can say, Madam Speaker, we abhor the fact that human trafficking is taking place, not only from people moving from other countries of the world, coming to Fiji and engaging in illicit activities, but also from within our own country, there is a lot of focus and emphasis on this. But the Government is not only looking at human trafficking *per se*, but if we need to look at human trafficking especially domestic human trafficking, we need to look upstream. We need to look at the things that cause human trafficking to take place. Of course, a lot of these things that are happening in our country in terms of young girls or young boys being trafficked to provide, you might call it sexual services, is as a result of poverty. There is being no other Government in the history of this country that has tried to deal with this issues of poverty as effectively as this Government has.

#### HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBER.- Hear, hear!

HON. J. USAMATE.- We have seen the emphasis on education from the Ministry of Education, the large amounts of money that we have put into education so we can provide education to all of our children. The large amount of money that we have put into early childhood education, primary schools and secondary schools; the emphasis on making sure that we can have a good educating system so that we can give that to children so that they do not have to resort to things that lead to poverty that opens them up to the opportunity to be engaged in human trafficking.

Yesterday, the Honourable Minister was talking about opening up this virtual museum. These are kinds of things that we are putting into creating an environment in which people will not move into things that lead to poverty. There has been so much emphasis on Government in opening up economic opportunities out in the rural areas to stop that migration of people from our rural areas into the urban areas.

From the Ministry of Social Welfare, there is so much effort to try to help the most marginalised in our society so that they do not have to engage in this.

So, the way I look at all of these human trafficking, the intent of the motion is good but I think there is already mechanisms in place. There are structures in place, there are plans, a vision, a commitment from Government to try to address this, so we do not need to come up with anything new. If you know, for instance that there is a massage parlour operating, there is nothing wrong with a massage parlour. Massage parlours are places where you go for a massage, unless you go there for something else.

(Laughter)

A lot of people who have had a hard day in the office, feeling stressed, where do they go? One goes for a massage. If you are going there for something else than I do not know what is wrong.

There is also talk about the fact that there are workers from other countries coming here and having children with our people. That is something that has been happening in this country for thousands of years. Fiji has been the melting pot of the Pacific for thousands of years. If you go back into our history, they said that the first people who came into this country were the *Lapita* people. They came here 100,000 years before the birth of Christ. *Lapita* people then followed by other different people, the Melanesian people came, we became a complex melting ground of different ethnicities and today we are called the *iTaukei*. There has always been a melting ground. Other people have come in, we mix and you know what comes out of that mix, a stronger country because you get the best from the different ethnicities that come. That is why Fiji is one of the most powerful economies in the Pacific...

HON. GOVERNMENT. MEMBERS.- Vinaka, vinaka.

HON. J. USAMATE.-... because we are a melting ground. So we should also see the benefits of these things. We do not just look at them as things that are disadvantage to us but there is a lot of benefit in these things. So I believe that a lot of the things that have been mentioned there, yes, human trafficking is something that is very bad but the Government understand this, we have a commitment to it, we have the promises to make sure we can continuously improve our processes so we can deal with it, so one day we can say that human traffic is a the minimal level. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you, I will now call on the Honourable Salote Radrodro to speak in reply.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Thank you, Madam Speaker, and I also thank all the Honourable Members who have contributed to this motion. But first and foremost, Madam Speaker, may I just again highlight the recommendations of the motion. The recommendation is calling for vigorous Government action to raise awareness through mass media campaigns. Secondly, to review current policies like immigration and border control policies in order to prevent and eradicate human trafficking in Fiji.

Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Minister for Labour for showing up that poster and all those posters that had been given to us now, and if we honestly take a vote around this House on who has ever seen these posters?

(Inaudible Interjections)

Madam Speaker, that is what this side of the House is calling for. Maybe these posters had come out from cartons, maybe there were there prepared but not being distributed, they were not being taken to workshops and training and that is what this motion is asking for, that you engage in mass media campaigns, do not just print it using Government resources and then it remains in the cartons. They have to be taken to the people, if I for one in the Civil Service am saying that I am seeing this for the first time, even though I work very closely with the Police Force in terms of elimination of violence against women and children, I can stand up here and say that I have never seen these posters. That goes to show the shallowness of these posters on how they are supposed to be used. Maybe they were just designed ...

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- How do you know?

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- May be, Honourable Minister for Finance, taxpayers' money is being wasted....

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- No!

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... because they are printed, and then they are just being left there.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- No!

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- That is what this motion is asking for...

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- That is called conjecture.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... to accelerate and raise the level of public awareness. That is what this motion is asking for, and I suggest, Madam Speaker, that we even begin in this House. Not just with the distribution of these pamphlets and posters, this House should seriously think of a platform, of a space where we should take this up because this involves our women and children.

Madam Speaker, I must also express my disappointment and grave concern on the comments by the Honourable Minister for Defence in saying that he is not supporting this motion. If there is anyone that should be standing up and saying to support this motion, I would call on the Honourable Minister for Defence.

Madam Speaker, if I just take our attention back to my motion, my motion basically consisted of the problems, and like the other side of the House had said, "we are well aware of the problem, it is a global problem." And, also in my presentation, I had highlighted, what legislation, what are the legislative framework that Fiji has in place? I had highlighted that.

I had also highlighted the challenges and these challenges were highlighted at the Attorney-General's Conference, and it was highlighted by the Director for Public Prosecution. If those were the challenges, then they should be picked up.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- They are getting workers working on it.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- If they had been picked up, as the Honourable Attorney-General is saying, it needs some kind of fast-tracking because it is not working.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- How do you know?

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- It is not working.

Alright, Madam Speaker, the Honourable Attorney-General is asking, how do I know. Let me tell you this story.

HON. OPPOSITION MEMBERS.- Tell them!

HON, GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- Tell us!

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- I was going to Nadi in this taxi, and then I asked the driver, "how do you make your business? Is the business good?", I was just creating a conversation. And then he said, "My trips are just between Suva/Nadi/Suva." I asked, "How do you make your money? Is it a good route?" He said, "Yes". Then, he started telling me the story that there is this Chinese agent, a lady that calls him up to go pick up people from the airport and bring them back to Suva, and straight to the wharf, because the fishing boats are there. This taxi driver is about 22 years old, quite young. Then I asked, "What happens?" He said that because he is raised in a Christian home, he is very concerned about the welfare of these people because they come out looking very scared.

Then, when he drops them off at the wharf, he sees another guy standing there that takes all their passports. I then asked, "What happens after that?" He said, "They go straight onto the boat."

So that, honourable Attorney-General is a real life situation. So, the problem is here in Fiji.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Have you reported it?

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Did you report it?

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- That also suggests, as contrary to the contribution from the other side, that our systems and processes are working....

HON. J. USAMATE.- We are improving there.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- If that is happening, I am just highlighting it that our systems and processes are not working or maybe, they need to work better, ...

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... and that is why this motion is here. This motion also calls, in one of the points that I had raised that resources be provided to the agencies.

I am glad all these interjections are coming because I know I am pressing one right button somewhere.

(Laughter)

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- It must be something that is pricking, it must be something that is the truth, and of course, we should all be concerned. You are not concerned about that?

HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- We are working in progress.

HON. OPPOSITION MEMBER.- You should do more.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Yes, Madam Speaker, I acknowledge, and I acknowledge that in my motion, that Fiji is making progress...

HON. J. USAMATE.- Thank you.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... but, what we are asking in this motion, is that the Government should raise vigorous mass-media campaigns because this issue is something that is not really discussed or addressed, and that is why we are moving a motion that Government use the resources to be able to raise the level of awareness regarding this issue.

Also, the second recommendation, is to review policies like Immigration and Border Control. This issue, in which we highlighted the increase in the No-Visa in countries that could come in to Fiji without any visa requirement.

We will recall that there was this case of bank theft, and there was a group of Asian nationals I believe, that was out in the newspaper. Those are the kinds of crimes that are entering Fiji now....

HON. J. USAMATE.- That is not human trafficking.

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- That is all linked to human trafficking. These are contributing factors to human trafficking.

HON. J. USAMATE.- That is not human trafficking!

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- Madam Speaker, the Honourable Attorney-General had mentioned that he had acknowledged all the issues, all the challenges that we have and I would request that he put his money where his mouth is, and give the relevant resources to all agencies to be able to raise levels of awareness in this campaign to eliminate human trafficking in our country.

In that regards, Madam Speaker, may I again, call on the other side of the House to vote conscientiously remembering that Mother's Sunday is just in front of us...

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... Children's Sunday we have just gone past....

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. S.V. RADRODRO.- ... because these are the mothers, women and children are the worst victims in this. And, I call on the other side of the House to vote conscientiously and vote for this motion. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Parliament will now vote on the motion.

The question is:

"That in light of the growing global issue of human trafficking and its human, social and economic destructive consequences, Parliament condemns human trafficking as a form of forced and bonded labour, acknowledges the efforts by the Government so far to combat trafficking and calls for –

- (a) vigorous Government action to raise awareness through mass awareness media campaigns; and
- (b) reviewing current policies like Immigration and Border Control policies in order to prevent and eradicate human trafficking in Fiji."

Does any Member oppose the motion?

(Chorus of yes and noes)

HON. SPEAKER.- There being opposition, Parliament will vote.

### Votes Cast:

Ayes : 14 Noes : 32 Not voted : 4

The motion is defeated

I now call on the Honourable Aseri Radrodro to move his motion.

HON. ROKO T.T.S. DRAUNIDALO.- Madam Speaker, I rise on a Point of Order.

Just a point of clarification, I think at the Business Committee yesterday, we were told that 20 minutes before the end of the day all business will stop for the End of Week Statements. I am not sure whether that is what....

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you for that reminder. Therefore, we will move on to item six on the Order Paper, given the time that we have.

#### WEEKLY ADJOURNMENT MOTION

HON. SPEAKER.- Before I call on the Honourable Member, I wish to remind Honourable Members that 10 minutes is given to the mover and 10 minutes to the Minister responding. The warning bell will be rung at 8 minutes and the final bell at 10 minutes. There is no other debate. I trust this is clear and I call upon the Honourable Prof. Biman Prasad to have the floor.

#### <u>Indentured System - Commemoration of Anniversary</u>

HON. PROF. B.C. PRASAD.- Madam Speaker, I move that:

In view of 2016 being the hundredth year since the end of the Indentured System in Fiji, this House therefore calls on the Honourable Prime Minister, Minister for *iTaukei* Affairs and Sugar Industry, to ensure Government organise events and activities, to commemorate the anniversary in recognition of our indentured labourers and their contributions to the development of Fiji.

Madam Speaker, on 14th May, 1879, the first batch of *Girmitiyas* or indentured labourers numbering 463, arrived from India on board the ship *Leonidas*. They were the first of a total of 60,553 Indians brought from the sub-continent between 14<sup>th</sup> May, 1879 and 11<sup>th</sup> November, 1916 when the indentured period ended. The last ship to arrive was *SS Sutlej*, carrying 898 *Girmitiyas*. They were brought

to Fiji by the British Colonial Government to turn the sugar industry into become the backbone of Fiji's economy.

Madam Speaker, most of the labourers did not take the option of returning to India upon completion of the indentured period and decided to make Fiji their home, to start their livelihood and primarily to continue strengthening the industry into Fiji's largest foreign exchange earner for more than a hundred years until the turn of the century when tourism and remittances overtook.

Madam Speaker, the indentured labourers and their descendants over the last hundred years have significantly contributed to the social, economic and political developments and advancement in Fiji and this is well-recognised and acknowledged by everyone. They live peacefully and harmoniously side by side with other races, especially with our regional inhabitants in these beautiful islands, the indigenous community or the *iTaukei* at all times with a few exceptions since the start of the *coup* culture in 1987, but overwhelmingly this peaceful co-existence and co-operation, the willingness of our landowners to share their resources and land, and the freedom for the descendants of our indentured labourers to put into practice their language, their culture, tradition, an integral part of the Indian civilisation, together with the blood, sweat, toil, tears, and lives sacrificed by our forefathers, as well as the immense contributions of other races has made Fiji what it has been for decades, the hub of the South Pacific.

Madam Speaker, Honourable Justice Jai Ram Reddy, whose speech, as a grandson of an indentured labourer, and is the Leader of the Opposition and the Leader of the National Federation Party to the Great Council of Chiefs on 6th June, 1997 will go down as a defining moment in Fiji's history, rightly said, and I quote:

"The Indians of Fiji brought to these shores as labourers did not come to conquer or colonise. Our ancestors came to this land in search of a better life, in search of a future they dreamed of for their children and their children's children. Though they travelled to these islands long after your ancestors, surely the dreams and hopes of those who landed from the *Leonidas* were not that different from those who came ashore after the hectic earlier voyage from the West."

Madam Speaker, after a hundred years since the end of the Indentured System, the time is right, not only for the celebration of our rich history in this multi-cultural society, but for a reflection of the freedoms gained and lost on the journey. Our forefathers operated on the basis of freedom, human rights, dignity and virtuous living. The values that over a period of time guided our fight against the vices of the indenture system.

Today, however, Madam Speaker, we seem to have somewhat forgotten and we have had some that would like us to forget those hard-fought virtues and principles in support of those who have taken our freedom in the past, but we have the perfect opportunity, Madam Speaker to put this right.

This year is particularly significant, it is hundred years since the end of the Indentured System. To mark this momentous occasion, the NFP would like to reiterate our need as diverse communities of a great nation to work together for our collective free and secure future.

Madam Speaker, there should be a celebration as well as a commemoration of that single momentous event that forever changed the destiny and the landscape of Fijian society. While the atrocities, trials and tribulations of the indentured system in Fiji had been well documented, the descendants of the *Girmitiyas* have moved on. This is evident in the way the third and fourth generations of Indo-Fijians of Indian descent have integrated themselves into Fiji's landscape. As such, they have tied their personal circumstances to the destiny of this country.

The celebration, Madam Speaker, should also be about a paradigm change, that is, we should move away from the rhetoric of the past. We need to strengthen a new culture of dialogue, unity and cooperation. This dialogue, Madam Speaker, should never include coercion or support of coercive activities. Moreover, the dialogue must incorporate diverse opinions from a broad spectrum of all ethnic groups that make up this nation. As such, celebrations like these, highlighting a specific group of people in all their diversity must be the cornerstones of all processes of nation-building. Therefore, Madam Speaker, it is important that we, as a nation, commemorate the 100 Anniversary of the end of the Indentured System, and to remember and reflect on the struggles and sacrifices of our forefathers for equality, dignity and justice for all our people.

We also believe Government should provide funding for a national celebration of *Girmit*, a celebration where the nation comes to grips with the diversity that in its essence, a diversity that demands mutual respect as the basis for a more secure and dignified life, and Madam Speaker, I therefore urge Government to declare a one-off public holiday for the celebrations and preferably on the 11th of November, the date of the arrival of the last ship in 1960.

We celebrated the 100<sup>th</sup> Anniversary at the start of *Girmit* in 1979 with a holiday, Madam Speaker, it is appropriate that we have a one-off national public holiday to commemorate the 100<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the end of indenture this year. The schools can be a perfect platform, Madam Speaker, and let us not forget that indentured labourers like Sadhu Kupswamy and Pandit Badri Maharaj, who founded the Indian School during indenture, were pioneers of education.

Lastly, Madam Speaker, just like in 1979, we should in a bipartisan manner, work in a framework of a Joint Parliamentary Committee and formalise the activities and programmes in the lead up to and also for the public holiday to ensure that it becomes a momentous occasion and celebration of our rich cultural diversity. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

(Applause)

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you, I now call upon the Honourable Prime Minister and Minister for *iTauke*i Affairs and Sugar Industry to have the floor.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, this does not need a Committee. It needs a little left-finger job and it has already been handled by the Minister for Education with the portfolio of heritage, so really, it is no big deal. That is the work of the Government and we have been doing it in the past and we do not need this move from a Member of Parliament, who has all of a sudden is now Indo-Fijian.

(Honourable Member interjected)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- In the last sitting, he has been supporting the extreme traditional policies of the *SDL*, the *iTaukei* movement. Madam Speaker, we know why this has come up, it is a gimmick, Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, I thank the Honourable Leader of NFP for his statement.

HON. PROF. B.C. PRASAD.- Point of Order.

HON. SPEAKER .- Point of Order.

HON. PROF. B.C. PRASAD.- A Point of Order, Madam Speaker, I think the Honourable Prime Minister is imputing improper motives with his statement for the NFP supports extremist views; we never have, we never will and that is the NFP's position, Madam Speaker.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. The issue you have brought up can be brought up as a substantive motion. It does not qualify under Point of Order process.

Honourable Prime Minister, please continue.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Thank you, Madam Speaker, and I thank the Honourable Leader of the NFP for his statement. Many of us are aware of the wonderful contributions to Fiji, of both the indentured labourers who were bought from British India to work virtually as slaves and the many thousands of descendants over the years.

The *Girmitiyas* are rightly celebrated for their role in building our nation and especially the blood, sweat and tears they expanded working in the harshest of conditions. They cleared bushland, grew crops, build roads, they were whipped, cursed and robbed of their dignity by the overseers under this oppressive system. Many of course at the end of the indentured system became sugarcane farmers, as they had worked as sugarcane labourers on farms owned by expatriate planters.

I have had the great pleasure as Prime Minister to take part in events that commemorate the arrival of the *Girmitiyas* and I know the significance of such events. The courage and resilience of the *Girmitiyas* has come to a source of inspiration, not only for their descendants, but for many other Fijians and we must not forget their contributions and mainstream the *Girmit* history in our school curriculum. So, Madam Speaker, setting aside only one day to commemorate the arrival of the *Girmitiyas* or the end of the *Girmit* is not enough. Indeed that is all you do, I would say it is an insult.

Madam Speaker, we had already celebrated the anniversary of the arrival of the first *Girmitiyas* on the *Leonidas* on 14th May, 1879 and Madam Speaker, the *coup* of 1987 was also executed on this day in this very House. It was then that Dr. Bavadra's Cabinet was removed from office and the many descendants of the *Girmitiyas* left our shore to seek refuge mainly in Australia, New Zealand and North America because of the racial prejudices bigotry and violence that were the hallmarks of the 1987 *coup*, and we saw that happened again in 2000.

Some in this House, Madam Speaker, are more familiar with this event than others, some in the House also suffered from this assault on our fellow citizens. Of course, Madam Speaker, some still today in this House make latent threats from time to time. Ironically these latent threats also comes from one of the Members of NFP.

Madam Speaker, there is also the question of spending priorities at the present time in the wake of *Cyclone Winston*. First, schools and homes and all other damage: public buildings and infrastructure that will need immediate and focused attention.

I am actually surprised yesterday and again today, when the Honourable Leader of NFP flagged his proposal at this particular time, given the priorities that he knows lie before us. He should as supposedly shadow Minister for Finance know that our immediate concern must be to cater to the desperate need of a great many ordinary Fijians, which include Fijians of all backgrounds and dedicating any spending at all to what he proposes simply it cannot be under Government's agenda and indeed would be seen as highly irresponsible at the present time.

Madam Speaker, without casting any sleight on the *Girmitiyas* and their descendants, I wonder why this proposal is being introduced on the last day of the first sitting of Parliament since *Cyclone* 

*Winston.* I have been sitting here, I asked myself this, and I have been sitting here asking myself yesterday and this morning, "why now?" Why does the NFP suddenly want the Government to agree...

HON. PROF. B.C. PRASAD.- ... since November.

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Wait, I will tell you! You wait.

Why does the NFP suddenly want the Government to agree to a special public commemoration of an historical event at this particular time? Why is he not asking for the commemoration to mark the contributions of the other set of enslaved workers: the Blackbird, Solomon Islanders, and others?

Then a thought suddenly dawned on me, Madam Speaker, that suddenly made sense, the three NFP Members of Parliaments have been sitting here whole week, giving aid and comfort to the most outrageous suggestion and behaviour from their Opposition partners in SODELPA. They sit idly by as the rebels opposite reduced this Chamber to one, to the lowest common denominator with their interjections, their tones and their threats. They sit idly by as SODELPA, when advancing propositions like the restoration of the GCC, laced their arguments with threats to peace and harmony and to undermine the hard-won democratic advancement of every Fijian.

(Hon. Member interjected)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Madam Speaker, I say in all seriousness that the founders of this great Party like A.D. Patel and Siddiq D. Koya will be appalled to witness how the Honourable Leader of the NFP and his colleagues has squandered their political inheritance. They have forged an alliance with the people who have questioned and opposed their very right to be considered Fijians ...

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- ... who believe in indigenous supremacy and restoring the political and institutional power of the Great Council of Chiefs, who have betrayed the interests of those who once saw the NFP as a great hope for Fiji's advancement and put their trust in it.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Imagine what some of these great figures of our history who are no longer with us would think, to see the Honourable Draunidalo get to her feet to support SODELPA's attempt to revive the GCC. Imagine their shock and bewilderment and all over Fiji this week, people watching these proceedings have seen a once great party enable the most appalling behaviour from their Opposition partners and supporting policy positions that they know are not in their interests or the interests of any other Fijian. It is only in the personal advancement of their political careers.

The NFP used to be a Party of Reform, the generator of ideas of this nation. It used to be a moral compass for a great many Fijians ...

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- ...it used to stand for principles once but no longer and, Madam Speaker, how can those who inherited this mantle of greatness find common political cause with those who do not regard them as equals, how can they do that? Who fought the concept of a common and equal citizenry that was once at the core of the NFP's philosophy, who fought the concept of a common name for all Fijians and especially the Honourable Draunidalo who still does not think non-iTaukei deserve the name? How can they sit with supporters of the 1987 and 2000 coups, those who preached indigenous

supremacy? How can they stand to be on the same side politically with those who drove tens of thousands of our best and brightest people from Fiji, whose ideas at that time set "Fijian against Fijian" triggered the attacks on innocent people and led to the looting and burning of our capital.

Madam Speaker, the NFP alliance with SODELPA not only makes no sense politically, it is an insult to the NFP's traditional support base and as sure as this Parliament rises today, after another memorable session, they will be punished at the next Elections for their appearament, weakness and lack of vision and resolve.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Madam Speaker, the current NFP Members are only good at giving the nod to the SODELPA rebels but even then, they know when things have gone too far, so to save their reputations at the end of a scotching week for the Opposition, they put their heads together and came up with a plan.

(Chorus of interjections)

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- And it goes like this, Madam Speaker, "Ok, let us take everyone's mind off a bad week for us with a diversion, let us make a last ditch effort to box the Government into a corner, and make ourselves look good by calling for an official commemoration of the *Girmitiyas* this year. We may win back some people we lost this week and worked on it. Bainimarama of course will have to say 'yes' because he would not be able to say 'No." Madam Speaker, the answer is 'No' and it is 'no' because this is an empty gesture. A political stunt, it is 'no' because the descendants of the *Girmitiyas* who have also suffered from the cyclone understand that we must put those needs first. Rebuilding Fiji and rebuilding our future is a more pressing our priority and that is the difference between the NFP SODELPA gaggle opposite and FijiFirst. Madam Speaker, history has shown us when people suffer as a group because of their ethnicity, the greatest gift you can give to them is to restore their dignity. Give them a rightful place in society and treat them as equals.

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Hear, hear!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- You know the best way to celebrate the *Girmitiyas* and their contribution to Fiji, it is a living monument here and now, not some historical commemoration. It is a Constitution that guarantees them genuine equality for the first time.

HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- Hear, hear!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- Successive Constitutions that were stacked against them, it is the guarantee of equal votes and equal value, that was a core demand of the NFP leadership in the 1950s and 1960s but it took the FijiFirst Government to finally deliver.

HON. GOVERNMENT MEMBERS.- Hear, hear!

HON. J.V. BAINIMARAMA.- And it is bestowing the name "Fijian" on every citizen and giving the decision of the *Girmitiyas* or any other citizen a common identity. Thank you, Madam Speaker, that is our tribute to the *Girmitiyas* and their sacrifice, to treat them and their descendants with respect, not to have the spectre of violence hanging over their heads and we must continue to remove discrimination against them in our everyday life. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

(Applause)

HON. A. SAYED-KHAIYUM.- Vinaka.

HON. SPEAKER.- Before I call on the Leader of the Government in Parliament to move the adjournment motion, I want to take this opportunity to thank all Honourable Members for the robust debate this week.

Women MPs are reminded of the presentation and lunch meeting directly after adjournment in the Small Committee room.

Lunch will be served for all other Members in the Big Committee Room.

Members of the Standing Orders Committee will receive Communication from the Secretariat in relation to meeting date and venue. Thank you.

I now call on the Leader of the Government in Parliament.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

HON. LEADER OF THE GOVERNMENT IN PARLIAMENT- Madam Speaker, I move:

That Parliament adjourns until Monday 30th May, 2016 at 9.30 a.m.

HON. A. SUDHAKAR.- Madam Speaker, I beg to second the motion.

HON. SPEAKER.- Thank you. Parliament will now vote.

The question is that Parliament adjourns until Monday 30<sup>th</sup> May 2016 at 9.30 a.m. Does any Member oppose the motion?

HON. MEMBERS.- No.

HON. SPEAKER.- Since no Member opposes, Parliament is now adjourned until Monday, 30<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 at 9.30 a.m.

Thank you Honourable Members.

The Parliament adjourned at 1.38 p.m.

Reply to Supplementary Question raised by the Hon. Ratu K. Kiliraki on Wednesday 27th April, 2016 [Refer Page 1624]



## Minister for Defence, National Security and Immigration

Honourable Mr. Timoci Lesikivatukoula NATUVA

# WRITTEN RESPONSE ON THE QUESTION OF EXTRADITION PROVISIONS AGREEMENT

Parliament	Friday 29th April, 2016
GOVERNMENT BUILDINGS	

#### Introduction

This written response is addressed to the Honourable Member of Parliament Mr. Kiliraki's supplementary Question on Wednesday 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 querying the Minister for Defence National Security and Immigration Hon. Timoci L. Natuva as follows – "Can the Hon. Minister provide names of foreigners, their original nationalities whom have applied and being granted Fiji dual citizenship; and in what capacity are they contributing to Fiji?"

#### Response by the Hon. Minister

This is a formal response in writing as confirmed by the Hon. Minister, to list 50 names of foreign professionals that have been granted Fiji dual citizenry; their country of origin; and what capacity they currently hold or how have they invested in contributing to Fiji's growth and development.

The list is tabled as follows:

	Name	Country of Origin	Type of Investment
1	Mr. David Murray Young	USA	Director/Shareholder Investments Limited- Adventure Sailing Cruise [Tui Tai]
2	Mrs Zou Rong	CHINA	Managing Director Bar 66 Nightclub in Suva
3	Mr Zhang Yifeng	CHINA	Director/Shareholder Good World Supermarket in Lami and 2 shops in Suva

4	Mr. William John Wragg	UK	Director/Shareholder Wahoo Watersports Limited at Tokoriki Island Resorts
5	Mr. Peter Joseph Rankin	AUSTRALIA	Director for Architects Pacific Limited.
6	Mr. Chia Yong Seng	SINGAPORE	Managing Director Southtex Fiji Limited  [Textile]
7	Mr. William Ernest James Crosbie	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder HLB Crosbie and Associates[investment aganecy]
8	Mr. Stephen Laurence Darling	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder Volivoli Point Limited t/a Volivoli Beach Resort
9	Mr. David Charles Jenkins	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder Trade Supplies [Fiji] Limited.Assembly/manufacturing/distribution of refrigerators and equipment, air conditioners and other industrial products
10	Mr. James David Kelly	USA	Director/Shareholder Nakia Resort & Dive in Taveuni [Hotelier]
11	Mr. Carl Marcus Fox	USA	Director/Shareholder Resorts and Beaches Investment Limited in Taveuni [hotelier]
12	Mr. Glen Alan Hughes	AUSTRALIA	Managing Director for Pasifika  Communications Limited [Media]
13	Mr. David Ralph Neil Jamieson	UK	Managing Director  Yacht Help [Fiji] Limited [consultancy service for yacht/super yacht]
14	Ms Hu Min	CHINA	Director/Shareholder Rainbow Chemicals [Fiji] Limited [preparation, packaging and bottling of household/industrial chemicals]
15	Mr Hu Mingxin	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder Hangton Pacific Company Limited [Fishing industry]
16	Mr. Ian Winston Thomson	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder Safari- Charters [Fiji] Limited [Hire/charter of yacht in Musket Cove]

TIME .	7 Mr Ryan Mitchell Irvine	AUS	Managing Director Irvine Investments International Limited t/a Manta Ray Island Resort
The state of the s	Mr Jiang Peng	CHINA	Director/Shareholdert Yongshan Plastics Manufacturing Limited [Manufacturing of plastic wares - garbage bags, containers, etc]
19	Mr. John Lewis	USA	Island Apiaries (Fiji) Limited (production and sale of honey and related products
20	Mr. John Ritchie Kemp	NEW ZEALAND	Asparagus International Limited (growing and exporting of herbs and asparagus).
21	Ms Kaylee Mariette Birch	CANADA	Aqua Safari [Fiji] Limited [Hotel activities - scuba diving, snorkelling, etc]
22	Mr Liu Hong	CHINA	Managing Director Western Marine Limited [ship construction and repairs and supplies of marine equipments]
23	Mr. Warren Gordon Maciver	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder Flame Tree Development [Fiji] Ltd [construction, land development and civil engineering company]
24	Mr. Marc Dennis McElrath	USA	Director/Shareholder Vuvale Restaurant Fiji Limited t/a McDonald's
25	Mr. Mark Morris Halabe	AUSTRALIA	Managing Director Mark One Apparel Limited  [Textile]
26	Mr. Riffat Mehmood Bhatti	PAKISTAN	Director/Shareholder Carz & Carz Limited [Import of cars/ vehicles]
27	Mr. Thomas Melvin Moody	USA	Managing Director Moody's Namena Resort on Namenalala Island in Vanua Levu
8.	Mrs Deborah Frances Hinton	AUS TRALIA	Director/Shareholder Advance Aviation Training Academy (aviation consultancy/pilot training)
9	Mr. Peter McCoy	AUSTRALIA	Managing Director Waterhouse Bet Limited t/a Grant Waterhouse
0	Mr. Phillip Stanley William Felstead	USA	Managing Director  Kula Environment Centre Limited [wildlife park, Korotogo]

31	Mr. Robert Edward	AUSTRALIA	Managing Director
	Lowres		Relcorp [Fiji] Proprietary Limited [real estate development - Naisoso Island]
32	Mr. Veeramalai Wanarajan	SRI LANKA	Managing Director Intimate Apparels Limited [Textile]
33	Mr Roland Schenkel	SWITZERLAND	Director/Shareholder Dolphin Bay Divers Retreat in Taveuni[Resort]
34	Mr. Bang Jun Heum	CHINA	Director for Green Argo Investment Company Limited, Suva. [Farming]
35	Mr. Fung To Wui Jacky	CHINA	Director for China Development & Construction Company (Fiji) Limited [Construction]
36	Mr. Tan Hai Teck	SINGAPORE	Managing Director for Maps Pacific (Fiji) Limited, Suva (Sale of vehicle spare parts)
37	Mr. Namsik Heo	KOREA	Director/Shareholder for Asia Pacific Engineering Limited, Suva. [Export of Scrap metals]
38	Mrs. Jacqueline Ann Watts	UK	Director for I Design Property Solution Ltd., Suva [Marine Vessel Management]
39	Mr. Jaga Leslie Crossingham	AUSTRALIA	Director/Shareholder for Freedive (Fiji) Charters Limited, Suva [Boat Charter & Diving]
40	Mr. Jiang Tao	CHINA	Director for Green Argo Investment Company Limited, Suva. [Farming]
41	Mr. John Garfield Andrews	AUSTRALIA	Shareholder for Zanin Holdings Limited, Suva [Resort Construction]
42	Mr. Kevin Gene Purser	USA	Managing Director for Designtech Limited, Lautoka. [Logging & Sawmill operation]
43	Ms. Kwang Ja Moon	KOREA	Director for Kwang Ja Moon Investment Ltd., Suva [Real Estate]
44	Mr Bang Sungsoo	KOREA	Director for Impact Incorporation Limited.  [Retailing of Computer Hardware & Software]
45	Mrs. Paula Clarice Greenville	NEW ZEALAND	Director/Shareholder for Greenville Property Services Limited, Nadi [Project Management Services]
46	Mr. Sung Young Kim	KOREA	Director/Shareholder for JPT Enterprise Limited, Lautoka [Export of Scrap Metals]
47	Mr Warwick Pleass	AUSTRALIA	Pleass Beverage [packaging - party items]
48	Mrs. Susan Janet Stone	USA	Managing Director for Tropic Splendor Fiji in Savusavu. [Guest House]

49	Mr. Wayne John Butcher	AUSTRALIA	Director for Occupational First Aid Response [First Aid Medical Response]
50	Mr. Zou Wei	CHINA	Director/Shareholder for Timber Products
			Processing Company Ltd., Suva [Furniture]

For your necessary information please.

Hon Timoci L. Natuva

Minister for Defence, National Security and Immigration

note: There are more and I think that 50 Justify the query.